The Students' Reflection on Hybrid Learning Environment at Higher Education Level post-COVID-19 Pandemic: Opportunities, Barriers, and Deal with Hybrid Learning

Haryati, Lisa Suhayati*, & Setiana Sri Wahyuni Sitepu

Department of English, Universitas Pamulang, Indonesia

*Corresponding email: dosen00604@unpam.ac.id

Abstract: The Students' Reflection on Hybrid Learning Environment at Higher Education Level post-COVID-19 Pandemic: Opportunities, Barriers, and Deal with Hybrid Learning. The implementation of remote learning and face-to-face leaning environment can be assumed as hybrid learning. It obtains its popularity since students and lectures are in the period of Covid-19 pandemic to endemic period. To systematize the hybrid learning, lectures need to be familiar with the kind of technology to create interactive learning activities in online learning and have physical activities in the conventional way or classroom activities. It also offers distinctive learning practices; students achieve technological and practical knowledge. **Objectives:** The study aims to explore the students' reflection on hybrid leaning. The reflection covers the opportunities they obtain, barriers they face and how they deal with hybrid learning. **Methods:** The students' reflection will be obtained through the questionnaire and observation during the onsite and remote learning activities. The observation will be conducted within 6 months in order to have eligible data. **Findings:** The writers hope that the further findings will portray the students' reflection in implementation of hybrid classes. Moreover, it is expected to enlighten the effectiveness and simplicity of remote learning and onsite learning environments. **Conclusion:** The most significant effect is the success of teaching and learning goals, and it will be the endless program in educational areas. Hence, lecturers and students are able to achieve the success of learning processes.

Keywords: face-to-face, hybrid, learning, online.

■ INTRODUCTION

Education technological development introduces many education products including the existence of hybrid learning. Hybrid learning has been popular since Indonesia got the Covid-19 in 2020. However, it has been applied by some universities when the pandemic changes to endemic situation. Some universities are still applying hybrid earning like Universitas Pamulang, universitas Terbuka, Universitas Multimedia Nusantara and other universities. Although it does not need to have face-to-face learning activities continuously, it presents the beneficial effects to students and lecturers especially with today's advanced technology. Therefore, students and lecturers are able to utilize the concept of hybrid learning outstandingly. Similarly, Manciaracina (2020) assumes that practitioners or lecturers are able to invent proper educational learning model based on students' reflection of hybrid learning.

Moreover, hybrid learning or distance learning involves the face-to-face and online learning process where students and lecturers need to come to campus. For other meetings, they do not need to come since they should join the online learning activities which can be accessed and learned anywhere with the periodic time. Online learning activities can be utilized in the various activities like e-learning platform, recording or other online media. In its activities, students will obtain the periodic schedule to join the conventional and online learning. This process is done during in one semester; it is conducted alternately so that all students can have conventional and online learning. This helps students and lectures socialize each other.

It is agreed that in the digital era, students and lecturers must be aware of the advanced technology. It assists them to explore their creativity and to achieve the teaching learning objectives. After pandemic situation, universities reapply the use of conventional learning process; it demands students to come to campus and rest to use e- learning platform or other online media. Therefore, it is crucial for universities to blend the online and conventional learning in achieving the teaching and learning goals although the pandemic is over (Gnaur, 2020). Consequently, the students and lecturers are able to explore themselves in accessing the digital or learning tools.

As the consequences, government allows universities to utilize the hybrid learning activities in campus in order to achieve the learning objective, not to stutter the advanced technology and able to enjoy the development of it (Bennett, 2020). It is true that it can be the solution in the digital era; however, it raises pro and contra among students and lecturers. Online learning has been forced to be implemented so that it creates the mental problems among students and lecturers. Stress is one of the causes of metal problem. It comes from the hectic schedule of online activities, and students need to do many tasks in short periodic time. They sometimes do not have adequate material discussion so that they are not able to comprehend the topic properly. Therefore, they need to seek other online material to earn the deeper understanding. In addition, students must be equipped with the technological improvement; it includes the digital learning application. In fact, some students lack of technological knowledge due to the limitation of possessing the digital products. They are not familiar with the use of them; hence, it leads the major academic reason why students need to experience to participate in face-to-face and remote learning models. Moreover, lecturers should spend much time to prepare the interactive material in learning process in order to the students obtain the sufficient or more material. They believe that the interactive learning activities will not be students' burden and will enhance students' motivation to learn more and more although they do not learn at campus with other peers.

Not only the barriers of hybrid learning but also the effectiveness of face-to-face and remote learning models should be observed. Hung et al. (2016) believe that hybrid learning leads to the existence of multiple learning styles. Lecturers are insisted to create interactive learning strategies in onsite and remote learning activities. Multiple learning styles also leads to the diversities of students' knowledge and information. Gutiérrez-Braojos et al. (2019) sum-up that face-to-face and online or remote learning environment deliver distinctive assumption. Lecturers assume that face-to-face learning activities are much better that remote learning environment as students achieve more understanding. However, remote learning contributes other positive side that the students have been familiar with the use of diversity of learning styles.

The studies of students' reflection have been investigated by some previous studies. They conducted the similar studies with the distinctive objectives. Eliveria, Serami, Famorca, & Cruz (2019) sum-up that students have positive

preferences in learning online since they can be more independent in comprehending the material and doing the tasks. Moreover, they assume that hybrid learning shares the positive insight on their understanding and practices. Pierce (2022) also highlights hybrid learning activities including offline and online learning should be employed to enhance the educational contributions. They are able to blend those activities by spending time to read a lot the online material, and they would be ready to discuss the topic with their peers to share and to perform their understanding. Nørgård & Hilli (2022) point out that two sides of reflection are offered. Students argue that face-to-face and onsite learning environments contribute the meaningful activities; on the other hand, they become stressful and frustrating.

In the relation of hybrid learning and students' perspective, Raes (2022) observes that remote learning process leads students to have isolated environment. They concern themselves and ignore their social life; in fact, social life supports the academic sense. In addition, the on-site students have lack of reading skills since they focus on practicing some physical presence. Briefly, both learning ways do not present the significant diversities. Both deliver successful learning process since they can achieve the theoretical and practical comprehension. Li (2023) reveals remote classes cause some barriers including the server, heavy workload, minor interaction and motivation, and unfamiliarity in a kind of technological products. Therefore, teachers or lecturers need to create interactive learning activities in the remote or in-site classes.

Furthermore, Karabulut-Ilgu & Jahren (2016) reveal that offline and online classes contribute close correlation between both learning classes; its constructive contribution exist if lecturers design the blended material efficiently in order to achieve the learning goals. Musdariah et al. (2021) describe hybrid learning model presents the encouraged impacts: attitude, abilities,

capability, and enthusiasm. Armin & Siregar (2022) find that hybrid learning activities offer no positive changes due to the internet breakdown and lecturers' unpreparedness in creating the interactive learning activities. In brief, previous studies represent some unique findings of hybrid earning. The varieties depend on the university characteristics, cultures, and advanced technology.

From the above previous studies, the writers focus on investigating two sides of student's reflection. They pursue the opportunities and challenges of hybrid learning in university scopes. Due to its limitation of study, the writers encourage to examine the other side of student's' reflection focusing on how students deal with barriers they will face in the hybrid earning environments. The new focus is expected as the research gap in the study. Moreover, it is supposed to solve their obstacles in participating the hybrid learning in the current situation.

Based on the pre-observation, it was found that the students have monotonous learning processes. During the learning process, the students focused on joining E- learning activity in the pandemic era, and the endemic situation, they focused on having on-site activities. Moreover, the students faced a drastic change from the conventional model to the online mode of education. It leads the students to adapt their learning and working schedules. It was complicated for the working students to join the whole conventional classes. It also affects them to prefer working than attending the class. In addition, the students had poor technological knowledge and network; this case existed when they participated in online classes. Lecturers did not promote various online activities; the students looked like silent audiences who obtained the lecturers' explanation.

The above-mentioned enlightenment leads the writers to believe that hybrid learning implementation is crucial for lecturers and

educational institutions to conquer the learning obstacles. Given these points, this study aims to seek for the experiences faced by the students of English Department of universitas Pamulang during and after the face- to-face and remote learning activities focusing on the opportunities, challenges, and how to deal with the challenges encountered by the interns. Knowing the students' reflection of hybrid learning activities will be beneficial information for lecturers, universities and college students. Therefore, they will know the positive and negative reflection, and universities and lecturers are able to discover the alternative techniques to encourage students' motivation in participating the learning activities and generating the conducive teaching and learning environment. It is hoped that the better findings can solve the problems for the future hybrid learning model, especially in the scope of universities, schools, and other educational institutions. Furthermore, government is able to collaborate with university and schools to design interactive and effective hybrid learning environment.

■ METHOD
Participant

The study took place at Universitas Pamulang Tangerang Selatan, Banten focusing on English department. There are some reasons why the writers conducted their research at universitas Pamulang. First, the writers have been teaching at the university for some years; therefore, they have been familiar with the hybrid system and the workplace in the university. Universitas Pamulang has applied hybrid learning system since 2022. The participants of this study were the fifth to eight semester students of English department, particularly the employee class since they are who have hybrid learning experiences. The total of the population was 980 students, but only 881 students who participated in completing the questionnaire. The writers used purposive

sampling to obtain the participants. Therefore, the participants were about 881 to support the research. students who participated in completing the questionnaire.

Research Design and Procedures

The writers used a descriptive qualitative approach to conduct their study. Vromen (2018) defines the qualitative research relies on human perception about the subjects and understanding. It is a kind of social study which collects data without considering the numerical results, and it helps people understand social condition. People generally state qualitative study is the opposition of quantitative study. Specifically, the writers analyze the finding through descriptive qualitative method. The writers provide several reasons why they apply qualitative approach. This study applies qualitative approach since it focused on subjective in nature. It includes some aspects like attitudes, gender, perception, and others (Neville, 2017). This design converges on people's perspective or interpretation; it highlights the description of subjects and blends the socio-cultural context. Moreover, the data were performed in the form of text (Mustafa et al. (2015), and it requires the detailed surveys. The type of this study is in the form of description of the data and result, opinion, and observation rather than numerical data.

Instrument

In this research, the writers used one instrument, questionnaire to support the research. Questionnaire was used as it enables to achieve large amounts of data, and it can obtain the high-rate responses from the students when administered at school or university. This research focuses on investigating the questions given in the questionnaire which are asked and what action will be performed based on what has already done (Young, 2015). The questionnaire was used to identify and describe

the opportunities experienced, the barriers encountered, and how to deal with the barriers occurred by the students when they employ hybrid learning activities. Hence, the writers could obtain meaningful and accurate data; hence, the research objectives can be accomplished.

The indicators in questionnaire refers to questions or statements aimed to identify the participants' perspectives. It provides the participants' agreement and disagreement level of phenomenon. The indicators in questionnaire included 4 scales: strongly agree, agree, disagree and strongly disagree. It consisted of 20 items of question focusing on the hybrid learning activity perspective of students. The items of questions are highlighted into three categories: the opportunities, the barriers and how to dealt with the barres of hybrid learning environment.

Data Analysis

To analyze the data, the writers did several procedures including the writers determined the population and distributed the questionnaire via Google Form focusing on the hybrid learning perspectives: the opportunities experienced, the barriers encountered, and how to deal with the barriers occurred by the students when they employed hybrid learning activities. Then, the writers determined the sample in the research; through the process, the questionnaire responses were clustered into three major points highlighted on objectives of the research. Then, the writers also identified the same and distinct arguments among participants. Each cluster was analyzed descriptively. Concussively, the participants' viewpoints were analyzed to obtain all-embracing themes, and the profound interpretations were presented descriptively.

■ RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The findings of the study are elaborated through content analysis. The writers distributed at the end of the semester and obtained 881 students who shared their perspective of hybrid learning. Here are the results of the students' perspective of hybrid learning: opportunities, barriers and how to deal with it. Higher education in Indonesia encounters significant change after COVID-19. Universities have to adapt rapidly to distance learning activity and technology advance. The digital advance facilitates the process of learning. After the pandemic, universities apply hybrid learning integrating offline and online learning activities.

While hybrid learning presents some opportunities exploited by lecturers and students, some varieties of barrier also exist. It is clear that digital technology presents the flexibility; however, not all students and lectures have adequate access to laptop, computer or smartphone. Having no good infrastructure, hybrid learning leads imbalanced educational gap. Moreover, lectures and students have been introduced the varieties of digital advances, but most of them have sufficient skill to operate the digital technology. They do not have the capability to use the online platform. From the case, universities can upgrade lecture's; and students' competence by sharing the training session. To sum up, in facing the digital era, higher education has big opportunities to i=optimize the hybrid learning strategy. With resolving the barriers, universities can create flexible and inclusive learning atmosphere

Generally, the results of questionnaire reveal that the students have shared their reflection on hybrid leaning activities. Twenty questions have their own distinctive percentage. It can also be concluded that most students strongly agree (65,36) with the hybrid learning implementation; they are aware that it offers some obstacles, but they know what they need to do to overcome the obstacles they find during the learning experiences. The above table is classified into three categories: the opportunities, the barriers and how to deal with them. It also shows most

students agree with the application of hybrid learning environment (29,46%), some students disagree with it (4,42%), and few students disagree (0,77%). Hybrid learning offers students to have the flexible time to access; it is in line with the principal of constructive learning that leads to the students' independence. This strategy offers the opportunity to students to explore, have self-reflection and interact with material flexibly; it supports the argument that hybrid learning enables student to enhance their motivation since they can control their learning strategy. Moreover, it opens the access other digital media leading to create students center like video, discussion forum, sound, and more. As the positive consequence, students can exploit this opportunity independently collaborated with other peers. In short, hybrid learning contributes the flexibility and control that strengthen active, collaborative and reflective learning; these suit with the constructive principal. As the result, the learning process will be more effective to enhance their knowledge, metacognitive skill and their material understanding. The detailed elaboration of three categories of students' perspectives are described below.

Opportunities
Hybrid Learning Allows Students to Be More Open and Independent

From the above result, it can be assumed that the students agree hybrid learning allows them to be more open and independent (91,97%). Being open and independent learners means the students are able to get more fruitful insight from offline and hybrid learning. The insight may come from lecturers or other additional innovative media like learning video or YouTube. They seek other media in order to learn more understanding. They argue learning through lecturers or module is not sufficient process; hence, they need to see other additional media. Learning through from some videos on YouTube allows the students to get

more understanding regarding the definition and the examples of one particular topic. Moreover, the students obtain more exploration from the media they learn.

Not only searching on other media but also having more deep discussion with other peers permits the students to be more independent learners. When they are conducting offline and online learning, they have opportunities to discuss one particular issue or topic with others. On the other hand, the online activities allow them to get more independent discussion. It can be seen from the students' activities; the students argue that hybrid learning makes students to have more assignments (89,50%). Having more assignments does not mean that the students will get depressed; however, they are trained to be more independent by having discussion with other acquaintances and searching on other learning media. This routine processes a consequentially leads to them to be more independent learners.

Integrating the opportunities of applying hybrid learning, the use of digital media and independent learning activity, can be included in curriculum. It can be done through training focusing on technology mastery, flexible leaning plan, and opportunity for students to obtain independent or autonomous and collaborative learning. Lecturers optimize hybrid learning to create more dynamic and effective learning experiences. Therefore, lecturers can equip students with interactive skill and knowledge in digital educational aspect. Briefly, digital media can enhance students to be more autonomous learners.

Hybrid Learning Allows Lecturers and Students to Accomplish Repetitive Activities

Hybrid learning atmosphere does not restrain lecturers and students to have repetitive learning activities: lecturers share the introduction at the beginning of learning (90,07%), lecturers use the simple language when teaching in both

offline and online learning (90,15%) lecturers give the students opportunities to argue and question for unclear points (91,86%), and they carry out both offline and online learning according to specified schedule (80,99%). Sometimes, sharing the introduction or warming-up is always done when students have offline activities; however, lectures always share the introduction of the topic. Hence, the students do not have any significant distinction of offline and online atmosphere. Moreover, the use of language is simply delivered; the students do not have any obstacle to understand the use of language. The difference is only the spoken and written language. Online activities are dominated by having the written expression while the offline activities are delivered in spoken expressions.

Furthermore, hybrid learning allows the students to argue and question for unclear explanation. Lecturers insist the students to share their personal argument of a topic or allow them to clarify some vague points. However, sharing argument is dominantly occurred when they involve the offline activities. In fact, they are able to argue and question in the online discussion forum, but it spends time since they need to write their arguments a lot. Hence, it limits them to share their intense argument. The last repetitive activity is conducted by the lecturers are having the specified schedule to involve in offline and online learning. The specified schedule assists the lecturers and the students to achieve their teaching and learning goals.

English hybrid learning takes over the conventional learning deficiencies, or conventional learning also covers the deficiencies of online learning. Hence, when it is blended properly, both combinations lead to the successful learning processes. Conventional learning in the classroom presents the deficiencies, and hybrid learning can be a complement for it. It also leads to the independent learning existence since students are trained to be familiar with the development of

digital learning products and forced to read more and more to obtain more comprehension. In the learning activities, students are taught the complicated concept of subject in the classroom; thus, students can achieve more understanding. However, hybrid learning can function to learn other points to get more independence, and students can technologically literate.

Basically, hybrid learning activity is not only learning combination of online and offline modes but also activity combination. It means students are able to conduct the flipped classroom which students need to read some online materials, comprehend and sum up the ideas. Afterwards, students are required to do some learning activities sin the classroom including presenting and discussing the material they have already comprehended. To conclude, it is not a learning combination between conventional and digital learning. Instead, both learnings offer opportunities, barriers, and how to deal with them.

Hybrid learning also presents several opportunities among students. Hybrid learning is claimed as digital learning process so that it can be accessed everywhere and whenever the students have available time. Abdelrahman & Irby (2016) illustrate that faculty members involving lecturers and students believe that hybrid learning offers positive and negation students' reflection. Some claim they hybrid leaning allow them to access beneficial online sources simply, but they also argue onsite class is much better to achieve students' achievement and comprehension. The effective time allows students to conduct the digital learning when they are encouraged to join (Erliza & Septianingsih, 2022). It also presents the qualified learning activities since students are encouraged to obtain more comprehension by reading the material through digital application. They can read the online material several times without turning the pages when they have book to read. Hybrid can share close relation with the students' health since they do not need to learn

outside or attend the offline classes all day. They must capable to comprehend the topic during their break at home while laying down or doing other fascinating activities at home. Moreover, it leads to autonomous learning (Anabel & Simajuntak, 2022). It trains students to have more responsibilities when they are doing the task. They do not rely on lecturers or others to learn a lot. The autonomous learners can be from the creative lecturers which they need to prepare interactive material by applying certain application or media. Moreover, Similarly, Eliveria et al. (2019) assume online or offline learning activities result students to accept remote environment to support their knowledge of technology enhancement. Furthermore, students believe in-class activities offer more understanding of conquering the source work. Both online and offline learning activities attempt to reinforce the educational environment and achieve teaching and learning objectives.

Hybrid Learning Insists Lecturers and Students to Apply Relevant Strategy

Learning strategy plays crucial roles in conducting teaching and learning process. It is one of the learning and teaching components influenced by some factors: objectives, teaching material, students, facility, time and lecturers. Lectures are aware that they need to apply relevant study in conducting offline or online learning. They may select the proper strategy for the students which is adapted with the students' needs, topic, students' mastery, and the media they have. They apply slightly different strategy when they conduct online or offline leaning activities (88,96%). The distinctive strategy should be relevant in order to affect on the students' comprehension and achievement. On the offline leaning activities, the lecturers apply instructional and interaction forms; they are implemented when they involve in offline learning activities. They include frontal teaching, demonstrative,

discussion, dialogue, or brainstorming. On the other hand, most lecturers apply assignment and collaboration forms in teaching through LMS (E-learning platform). They include literature study, mind map, homework, project-based learning or group work. Those strategies are blended in order to achieve the teaching and learning goals. The blending activities can be implemented when the students need to present their assignment or project in the offline learning activities. Those blending processes can be effectively done since lecturers deliver the offline and online sub material properly (92,14%).

Hybrid Learning Motivates Students to Learn and Leads to Creative and Critical Thinking

It is brief that hybrid learning is the collaboration between online and offline learning activities aimed to enhance students' capability in technological improvement, to enrich students' mastery of particular topics, to lead students to be more independent learners, to motivate students' active participation, and to upgrade the material content. Teaching and learning activities should be occupied by the developments of technological products. Knowing and mastering the technological products could lead the students' motivation in joining the learning processes (88,68%). From the percentage, it can be assumed that most students agree that the implementation of hybrid learning can motivate students' eagerness to learn a lot.

Moreover, hybrid learning leads to the students' creative and critical thinking (89,78%). Creative and critical thinking has relation to the education of character building. They are one of the most crucial aspects in enhancing students' potency. Character building is aimed to form students' personality, moral values and positive attitude. Briefly, in the digital era, hybrid activities can be one way out to blend offline and online learning. It leads to critical thinking; hybrid

learning can encourage students to think critically and creatively. Lecturers allow them to observe, to do analysis, and to solve the problem of distinctive cases. In those activities, they should associate their knowledge with the social relation; hence, they are able to enhance the complexity and lead to the existence of critical and creative thinking. Those activities are asserted as collaborative learning (85,39). Collaborative learning merges the interactive learning strategy and students' experiences in offline and online learning; thus, when students blend the whole activities and experiences in doing project work, they will find a way to solve it. Then, it affects on existing students' creativity and critical thinking.

Barries of Hybrid Learning
Lecturers Have Less Explanation on Online Learning than the Offline Learning

The challenge in online learning is not a single factor. It has some external factors; it affects on the learning effectivity. One of the factors is the change of the lecturer's way to teach within online and offline learning. The change of learning strategy can be in the form of explanation; the lecturers focus on explaining more topics in offline learning than online learning (89,50%). They just share the short summary of a topic on e-learning platform and provide less explanation and examples since lecturer will aim to check the students' responses. Usually, lecturer remove several complex topics in online activities in order to avoid misunderstanding among them. Moreover, the lecturers do not have much time to elaborate the material effectively since they need to provide more explanation in whole classes they teach; those explanation should be elaborated in the written context. In offline learning, they are able to occupy their time to explore the explanation and provide more examples in spoken contexts.

They argue that explaining material in the written context is not something simple to do.

Actually, the discussion forum provides the large space for lecturers to write a lot of ideas; however, the students barely read the whole information given. As the result, the students have restriction to ask some unclear point to the lecturers since they face the distinctive learning situation. They need to read many learning materials in specific time; consequently, they feel chaotic and tend not to concern. In this case, the lecturers share the module and hand out; on the other hand, the students admit thar they do not learn the references given. They also argue that they need much time to write their responses in written contexts; they need to arrange the coherent and readable ideas; it is complicated that spoken expression. Lecturers give intensive responses on offline activities but not on online activities.

The improperness of teaching strategies will be the major barrier in achieving the learning objectives (Al-Enzi, 2023). One example is illustrated; lecturers provide more explanation in onsite classroom meanwhile they have deficiency when they conduct online learning. They provide less explanation and focus on the task. Hence, it leads to poor eagerness to participate in online learning (Leatemia, 2016). In addition, hybrid learning presents students' less understanding. Students are not able to comprehend the material since they spend their time to read a lot and have no brief explanation from lecturers. They focus on doing the online task; they have also opportunity to question unclear points, but online space does not support the explanatio restrictedly. However, onsite students have more understanding since they obtain clear explanation.

Furthermore, the causes of obstacles in implementing hybrid learning are often related to lectures' low skills in utilizing the technological advances. In general, technology has developed significantly and suggested to be a part of leaning integration. In brief, there several factors why lecturers face obstacles in implementing the

technological advances optimally. It includes lack of digital media training, distrust of digital application, constraint of time, and change resistance. To overwhelm these obstacles, it is crucial for institution or university to provide the technology training for lecturers in order to create interactive learning environment between students and lecturers. They also need the university support in implementing the hybrid learning especially when they conduct e-learning activity. The solution offers lecturers to achieve their effective digital skills; it results quality of hybrid learning performed by lecturers.

The Server is Sometimes Getting Down

Internet connection and server can be another challenge in participating in online learning; the server here means the interest connection stability. Server plays crucial role in joining the online activity (89,78%). The students sometimes face this obstacle at the end of the due time of e-learning. Essentially, the students have 6 days to join the e- learning platform, but they join one or two days before the due time; as the result, most students participate at the same time, and it causes the server poor. However, it does not occur frequently. This challenge leads to the students' absence as they do not have time to join the discussion forum on E- learning platform. They are not able to access it as it is locked by system automatically.

Universitas Pamulang applies hybrid learning through the use of E-learning platform; it is conducted in seven meetings of offline learning, and seven meetings of online learning. It triggers the students to be back home during their online learning. It is brief that Universitas Pamulang has multicultural students coming from distinctive or isolated areas from internet connection. This challenge leads the students not to participate in online activity. As the result, the students have poor attendance and affect on the students' poor grade; the lecturers are not able to achieve the

learning goals and the students have less material understanding.

Learning strategies may have some barriers; hence, hybrid learning presents some barriers. Armin & Siregar (2022) also highlight onsite and remote learning activities are not the proper learning strategy due to its internet instabilities and lecturers' unpreparedness in employing distinctive teaching strategies in both onsite and remote classes. Erliza & Septianingsih (2022) who share that students present convinced perspectives regarding hybrid learning in social communication, technological literacy, independence. Moreover, students mention hybrid learning provides some pessimistic perceptions including less encouragement to join online learning as it is complicated for them to obtain deeper understanding. It is caused by the lecturers do not provide any deep explanation. Furthermore, another is the learning synchronization (Bulow, 2022). It means lecturers should provide attractive online and onsite activities. The lecturers know when they should place one proper material in online and another is in the onsite classroom. In fact, lecturers need to prepare teaching aids properly for the distinctive learning classrooms so that students are encouraged to learn more in both remote and online learning activities.

Students Face Difficulty in Managing the Learning Schedule

The blending learning between online and offline activities have been prevalent among lecturers and students in universities since they find the flexibility of learning processes. With its flexibility, students have responsibility to conduct their own learning schedule. Managing online learning should be organized properly based on students' need and time. Basically, online activity provides the simplicity as students are able to access the material anytime when they have the leisure time. On the other hand, the blended or hybrid learning offers one major challenge among

students; it is the difficulty to manage the learning schedule (81,02%).

It is brief that hybrid learning is not the simple learning system to be implemented. University needs to manage the online and offline schedule properly; they also need to arrange the subjects. It also changes the students' habit in joining the learning activity. Once they need to join the offline class; on the other occasion, they need to participate on online learning through E-learning platform. Therefore, the students need to manage their learning schedule every week. Managing the schedule is not simple to do as they have to know the certain time what subjects should be online or offline modes. It leads the students to be discipline and to focus in order to manage their learning time table. Moreover, each student presents his distinctive learning style; some enjoy the offline class, and the rest enjoy the online class. The students should have optimal time to conquer the learning materials, but they have to balance their time between studying and working. Some of them are able to learn in the morning or at noon; some enjoy learning at night. In short, the previous situation leads students to have difficulty to manage their schedule particularly their online schedule.

In the hybrid activity, the students have to know when the online and offline classes begin. In the hybrid learning implementation, they have 7 online and 7 offline meetings with the various subjects they have in one semester. Thus, the students should use their time effectively; when they enable the schedule appropriately, it is believed that they will not find any challenge in hybrid learning. Through the observation, the students are able to utilize the digital media to arrange their learning schedule; it assists them to notice their current schedule. However, the writers find that most students miss the online meeting as they need to attend the offline class and to work; hence, it is crucial for the students to manage their earning schedule in hybrid classes. Having good learning schedule lead them to achieve the earning

objectives and the material mastery.

It Creates Poor Communication Among Lecturers and Students

Briefly, in 2023, teaching and learning processes are conducted through onsite class, and universities declare that student may put their masks off in the inside or outside class. However, some other universities combine the offline and online classes in the period exclusively to cover the employee class. Since they are aware that they need to do both studying in hybrid activities and working; they need to insist themselves to have dynamic interaction during the online and offline classes. In the teaching and learning process, lecturers must be able to deliver the information properly. They share the summary in the form of Power Point, module and short summary; however, students have lack of the interaction with lecturers. They join E-learning with the domination of written context. Comparably, students have good interaction in the offline class as they are able to question, argue and discuss the topic learned. When students apply online activity, they find out challenge with lecturers since lecturers do not respond the students' answers or arguments promptly. It leads online learning provides the poor interaction among the class participant (80,75%)

In general, active interaction among lecturers and students determine the accomplishment of learning process. Thus, students demand the online class offers good communication in order to make students be more argumentative and informative. On the other hand, the students need to comprehend the material discussion by themselves and conquer the assignment by having their less comprehension. Sorely, they are not able have direct communication with lecturers to clarify the unclear points in each meeting. Although, the discussion forum on E-learning provides large space to respond a lit in the written context, lecturers and students are reluctant to explain a lor there.

Hence, it leads to the poor students' comprehension and the failure of students; achievement.

The above challenge can be solved by elevating the communicative skill in the written context on the discussion forum in order to reinforce lecturers' and students' responsibilities and to enhance learning achievement. In case lecturers know their students' needs, they will share many references to read and open in having the certain discussion; it can be conducted at the articular time to discuss the crucial points. Practically, students do need the lecturers' feedback to obtain more elaboration of a certain topic. It will lead to teaching and learning quality in educational sector. Moreover, learning activity will be more effective and two-way communication. Minimum interaction among them indicates another challenge like poor encouragement in learning.

How to Deal with
Students Reflect the Material in Both Online and Offline Learning Process

It is clear that the duration of teaching and learning activity in universities tends to be short. Certainly, students do not feel satisfied just by having lectures' explanation in both online or offline. To deal with this challenge, students need to repeat material to strengthen their knowledge that they have acquired from the lecturers. However, it is believed that students have their own style to learn; some are reluctant, and rest is hard- working to repeat lesson given. Those who are reluctant to repeat chooses other attractive activities like game and social media. Students prefer having lesson repeating as they know they will acquire several beneficial advantages (85,39%). They argue that their comprehension will be better; they really know the duration is too short to learn one new topic even though lecturers have elaborated the material. Hence, they prefer repeating whole materials; they believe it elevates their mastery comprehensively. More

than that, they identify several unclear points, build interactive with peers, and few of them seek lecturers' clarification; this repetitive activity is believed to be able to achieve students' meaningful comprehension. Moreover, lesson repeating leads students to memorize certain material straightforwardly. Generally, many students apply overnight learning system when they face exam; it leads to feel exhausted and stressed. Most students are aware that learning regularly affects on their exam achievement as they need to recall whole understanding.

Students Ask For Help other Acquaintances to Clarify the Topic and Assignment

Briefly, one of the students' challenges in having the hybrid learning is poor interaction among lecturers and students. In this case, there is one thing the students can do to overcome their challenge; they should be more active to create effective interaction when they meet the online class. Also, they take the opportunity to have initiative communication and exploit it to have online discussion or chat. It can be done not only with lecturers but also other acquaintances. Therefore, when they do not get the immediate responses from lecturers, they build their own class discussion with other to reduce the misunderstanding of material given (78,97%). This way is affectively proven that they enable to cope with their challenge.

Moreover, class discussion initiated runs effectively that they can learn a lot from those why have already obtained more understanding. The success is invented due to the simple language they have; the language simplicity is achieved as they have good bond as acquittances. Based on the observation, some representatives from each class sometimes oblige lectures to respond their arguments; they assume that lecturers' feedback is crucial point for their improvement. The writers also find that students ask for help other acquaintances to clarify the topic and assignment at the end of the due time of online schedule. In

fact, they have 6 days to participate in the online discussion forum, but they share their argument three or two days before the deadline; it leads to have lack of lecturers' feedback. Although they gain the responses, it is too specific and detail; sometimes, their argument is not answered yet. Due to this obstacle, students overcome their challenge by having communication or making class discussion to ask for help other acquaintances to clarify the topic and assignment

Students Need to Seek Other Online Material to Cover Their Curiosity of The Topic. Students Mostly Learn on Other Digital Media

Previously, technological products assist students and lecturers to conduct teaching and learning process and broaden communication network; thus, it transforms their learning styles. The enhancement of sharing information expands rapidly, and it is reachable; however, it affects on less interest in reading appropriate books to support their understanding. It can be assumed that students prefer searching some information on video or other social media in order to find out unclear points they learn in online learning (78,89). They do that learning strategy as they have got lack of explanation in online learning and poor interaction among online class participants.

In the observation, lecturers have shared the material through Power Point, module and short summary, but they are not sufficient sources to learn. They need brief and alive explanation, and it can be achieved through the use of online source particularly YouTube. They argue that YouTube application is the most well-known among students as its flexibly and simplicity. They enable to tutors, sounds, visual and textual aspects. They assist students to achieve whole they need. They also realize that when visiting YouTube, students should choose the topic selectively in order to obtain the appropriate material. Some videos published on YouTube can be hoax and uneducated information; hence it is critical to select proper information. They also claim that technological product like YouTube is having many beneficial effects on their learning activities. They agree they have got some learning sources from lecturers, but they pleasant to search information on YouTube or other media as they consider the information explained there is simple to comprehend, and they also obtain fruitful insight. In the activity of searching information, most of them repeat video for several times until the achieve they require. The interactive and short explanation on video encourage them to learn more. Another crucial point is students prefer selecting this medium as it offers affordable in price; they just spend their less quota to access many fruitful videos. Hence, it is achievable for students to obtain more positive enthusiasm in online learning. It can be also their complement source to clarify unclear points they have during online class.

Searching additional online material on YouTube enables to enhance students; comprehension if it is implemented with the involvement of active students in learning activity. In principle of constructivism, multimedia learning, active learning and self0regulated learning, video as the additional material can be affective strategy to deepen students' understanding if YouTube is used properly, and students involves on it enthusiastically. Chien et al. (2020) assumes students perform better when YouTube assisted learning support their activities. It is in line with Qomariyah et al. (2021) whi highlight students obtain more motivation when learning activity is supported with the use of YouTube video. Students can use it to reflex or recall the material; however, YouTube video provides temporary understanding and will not depend students' mastery in long term learning activity.

University plays crucial roles to assist students to overwhelm the obstacle in implementing hybrid learning by providing human resources and support that facilitate learning

experiences to be more effective and applicable. One way can be conducted is to provide learning sources more integrated on Learning Management System (LMS). Briefly, lecturers can provide the integrated learning material and easily accessed on LMS. Lecturers can integrate all learning material like module, video, quiz, exam, and discussion forum on LMS. University also needs to create the tutorial to access all features on LMS and to have open access 24 hours in a day. It can conduct digital training or workshop to enhance lecturers' technology advance like Zoom, Google Meet or others. University also motivates lectures to create positive interaction between lectures and students. This interaction involvement is done through discussion forum or online chatting.

This research recommends university to design structured hybrid learning curriculum. The curriculum can be designed by integrating the offline and online courses. It can be conducted through the interactive processes like video, discussion forum and online test. It is believed hybrid learning leads to balance of synchronous (question dn answer session, discussion, and lecture) and asynchronous learning (online discussion forum, online task, and independent learning activities). It is also recommended for university to upgrade the policy of module production. It should be simplified and structured; it leads to autonomy for students to choose students' learning styles.

During the hybrid learning activities, the students know how to deal with the barriers. Students prefer having lesson repeating as they know they will acquire several beneficial advantages. many students apply overnight learning system when they face exam; it leads to feel exhausted and stressed. Most students are aware that learning regularly affects on their exam achievement as they need to recall whole understanding. Moreover, students ask for help other acquaintances to clarify the topic and assignment at the end of the due time of online schedule. they should be more active to create effective interaction when they meet the online class. Also, they take the opportunity to have initiative communication and exploit it to have online discussion or chat. It can be done not only with lecturers but also other acquaintances. Students prefer searching some information on video or other social media in order to find out unclear points they learn in online learning. They need brief and alive explanation, and it can be achieved through the use of online source particularly YouTube. They argue that YouTube application is the most well-known among students as its flexibly and simplicity. They enable to tutors, sounds, visual and textual aspects. They assist students to achieve whole they need. Furthermore, they need brief and alive explanation, and it can be achieved through the use of online source particularly YouTube. They argue that YouTube application is the most well-known among students as its flexibly and simplicity. They enable to tutors, sounds, visual and textual aspects. They assist students to achieve whole they need.

Learning focus which is owned by employee students is different from the students who only study at university and it can affect the result of this research because this group has different goals of study which is different from full time students. It is not easy for employee students to dig more about the material learnt due they have two focuses: working & studying. The research which only involves employee students may not describe aspiration and motivation which are owned by unemployed students involve. Because of the similarities in social, economic and educational features of employee class students, the results of research that only includes this group tend to provide a limited representation. To increase the external validity of the study, future researchers could consider including groups of students from more different circumstances, including full-time students, unemployed students, and those with different socioeconomic

experiences.

■ **CONCLUSION**

Based on the study, it can be assumed that the implementation of hybrid learning in university level provides two ways of learning remote and onsite experiences. During the implementation, it leads to the opportunities: students become autonomous learners, lectures provide relevant strategy, and students produce critical thinking. It also leads to some barriers: students obtain less explanation from the lecturers, the server is sometimes down, and scheduling the time is complicated. Although, hybrid learning presents the barriers, the students know how to deal with them: creating active communication with lecturers and acquaintances, repeating the lesson given, searching other digital media to learn a lot.

Nevertheless, this study presents some limitations, including only involve the employee students as the participants since they have some years hybrid learning experiences. It will be improved if further researchers investigate the use of hybrid learning for whole students in one department to enrich the hybrid learning refection. Furthermore, this study applies only the questionnaire to obtain and describe the data. It is suggested for the further researchers to have depth-interview to have more complex findings. By having more background of the participants and depth-interview, further researchers are considered to achieve more positive opportunities.

■ **REFERENCES**

Al-Enzi, A., Almutawaa, D. S., Al-Enezi, D., & Allougman, F. (2023). An analysis of the academic effectiveness of hybrid learning: the experiences of faculty and students in Kuwait. *Journal of Applied Research in Higher Education.*

Armin, D. S., & Siregar, A. M. P. (2022). Students 'perspective on hybrid learning after the covid-19 break: a learning reflection through photovoice. *Jurnal Tarbiyah,* 29(2), 367-380.

Anabel, T. W. V., & Simanjuntak, D. C. (2022). Obtaining preferences from a hybrid learning system to promote English-speaking ability through focus group discussion. *Journal of languages and language teaching*, 10(2), 118-133.

Bennett, D., Knight, E., & Rowley, J. (2020). The role of hybrid learning spaces in enhancing higher education students' employability. *British Journal of Educational Technology,* 51(4), 1188-1202.

Bai, H. (2022, January). Students' use of learning management system in hybrid learning: Mobile or not. In *International journal on E-learning* (pp. 5-23). Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE).

Bülow, M. W. (2022). Designing synchronous hybrid learning spaces: Challenges and opportunities. *Hybrid learning spaces*, 135-163.

Chien, C. C., Huang, Y., & Huang, P. (2020). YouTube videos on efl college students' listening comprehension. English Language Teaching, 13(6), 96-103. 10.5539/elt.v13n6p96

Eliveria, A., Serami, L., Famorca, L. P., & Cruz, J. D. (2019, February). Investigating students' engagement in a hybrid learning environment. In *IOP Conference Series: Materials Science and Engineering* (Vol. 482, No. 1, p. 012011). IOP Publishing.

Erliza, S., & Septianingsih, P. A. (2022). Undergraduate students' perception of hybrid learning: voices from english language education students in pandemic era. *Journal of English Language Teaching and Linguistics*, 7(1), 231-243.

Gnaur, D., Hindhede, A. L., & Andersen, V. H. (2020, October). Towards hybrid learning in higher education in the wake of the

COVID-19 crisis. In European Conference on e- Learning (pp. 205-XV). Academic Conferences International Limited.

Gutiérrez-Braojos, C., Montejo-Gamez, J., Marin-Jimenez, A., & Campaña, J. (2019). Hybrid learning environment: Collaborative or competitive learning? *Virtual Reality,* 23, 411- 423.

Haningsih, S., & Rohmi, P. (2022). The pattern of hybrid learning to maintain learning effectiveness at the higher education level post-COVID-19 pandemic. European *Journal of Educational Research*, 11(1), 243-257.

Hung, Y. H., Chang, R. I., & Lin, C. F. (2016). Hybrid learning style identification and developing adaptive problem-solving learning activities. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 55, 552-561.

Karabulut-Ilgu, A., & Jahren, C. (2016). Evaluation of hybrid learning in a construction engineering context: a mixed-method approach. *Advances in Engineering Education*, 5(3), n3.

Leatemia, L. D., Susilo, A. P., & van Berkel, H. (2016). Self-directed learning readiness of Asian students: students' perspective on a hybrid problem-based learning curriculum. *International journal of medical education*, 7, 385.

Li, K. C., Wong, B. T., Kwan, R., Chan, H. T., Wu, M. M., & Cheung, S. K. (2023). Evaluation of hybrid learning and teaching practices: The perspective of academics. *Sustainability*, 15(8), 6780.

Musdariah, A., Basri, M., & Jabu, B. (2021). The impact of hybrid learning in teaching english for business communication in Vocational Higher education of Indonesia. *International Journal of Humanities and Innovation (IJHI)*, 4(3), 104-110.

Mustafa, S. Z. B., Kandasamy, M., & Yasin, M. S. M. (2015). An analysis of word

formation process in everyday communication on Facebook. International Journal of Education and Research,3(6), 261-274.

Nørgård, R. T., & Hilli, C. (2022). Hyper-hybrid learning spaces in higher education. In Hybrid learning spaces (pp. 25-41). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

Pierce, R. (2022, April). WebLive students' perspective on hybrid learning. In Society for Information Technology & Teacher Education International Conference (pp. 224-228). Association for the Advancement of Computing in Education (AACE).

Qomariyah, S. S. A., Permana, D., & Hidayatullah, H. (2021). The effect of YouTube video on students' listening comprehension performance. Jo-ELT (Journal of English Language Teaching) Fakultas Pendidikan Bahasa & Seni Prodi Pendidikan Bahasa Inggris IKIP, 8(1), 67- 73. P https://e-journal.undikma.ac.id/index.php/joelt

Raes, A. (2022). Exploring student and teacher experiences in hybrid learning environments: Does presence matter? *Postdigital Science and Education*, 4(1), 138- 159.

Salama, R., Uzunboylu, H., & El Muti, M. (2020). Implementing online questionnaires and surveys by using mobile applications. *New Trends and Issues Proceedings on Humanities and Social Sciences*, 7(3), 48-70.

Vromen, A. (2018). Qualitative methods. Theory and methods in political science, 237- 253.

Young, T. J. (2015). Questionnaires and surveys. Research methods in intercultural communication: A practical guide, 163-180.