

## **Citizenship Education in Self-Awareness and Tolerance : Implementation of Pancasila Values of College Students**

**Salwa Anggraeni Khriswina<sup>1\*</sup>, & Rian Nurizka<sup>2</sup>**

<sup>1</sup>Department of Education and Psychology, Yogyakarta State University, Indonesia

<sup>2</sup>Department of Education, PGRI University Yogyakarta, Indonesia

\*Corresponding email: [salwaangraeni.2023@student.uny.ac.id](mailto:salwaangraeni.2023@student.uny.ac.id)

*Received: 05 May 2024*

*Accepted: 07 June 2024*

*Published: 12 July 2024*

**Abstract: Citizenship Education in Self-Awareness and Tolerance : Implementation of Pancasila Values of College Students. Objective:** This study aims to describe the implementation of Pancasila values towards self-awareness and tolerance among UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers. **Method:** Using qualitative research with a case study approach. The subjects of UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers by interviewing semi-structured interviewees were analyzed using the Miles and Huberman data model. **Findings:** show that there is an implementation of Pancasila values to foster self-awareness and tolerance among fellow UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers in every class that has diversity of ethnicity, religion and daily culture. This is shown by the application of the pancasila precepts that have been applied in the classroom to appreciate every difference that exists. As a result, UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers have an attitude of awareness and tolerance towards others by respecting and respecting each other's differences side by side. **Conclusion:** Through pancasila education in this global era by applying and pouring it in the form of actions carried out daily and continuously is very effective in efforts to form an attitude of self-awareness and tolerance in students who are pluralism.

**Keywords:** pancasila values, self-awareness and tolerance, college students.

### ***To cite this article:***

Anggraeni, S., Khriswina, & Nurizka, R. (2024). Citizenship Education in Self-Awareness and Tolerance : Implementation of Pancasila Values of College Students. *Jurnal Pendidikan Progresif*, 14(1), 692-703. doi: 10.23960/jpp.v14.i1.202450.

### **■ INTRODUCTION**

Education is a very important thing in the formation of character and identity in each individual (Althof & Berkowitz 2019). Education is the main foundation in the formation of identity, character and social attitudes (Inanna, 2018). Education is important in teaching the meaning of diversity of beliefs and tolerance of religion, ethnicity, and culture. (Ahmed et al. 2022). Education has a vital role in educating the next generation which not only educates children to become individuals who have character, morals and are academically intelligent, but in a broader scope, namely educating the next generation to

adapt well in the wider community environment (Banks, 2017) which consists of various backgrounds both in terms of education, social, cultural, ethnic, economic conditions, and their respective beliefs that are embraced without coercion from any party (Emily, 2021).

In the course of the history of the Indonesian nation, various turmoil has arisen and interfered with the nation's sovereignty. Some of the turmoil that often arises is related to religious issues, tribal issues, and even racial issues (Pace, 2019). However, the conflict that is most visible in the media and seems mainstream is the conflict that is related to religion, between one religion and

another or we can mention Islam and Christianity as two fairly large religions in Indonesia. Religious conflicts in pre-service elementary school teachers are no exception. Pre-service elementary school teachers have a variety of religions and among them are Islam and Christianity. Often, pre-service elementary school teachers with a strong Islamic religion or following one of certain community organizations are prohibited from blending in or are not willing to blend in with pre-service elementary school teachers who are Christians, and vice versa (Llopart et al. 2018). Pre-service elementary school teachers with Christianity are often reluctant to mingle with Islamic students for fear of being influenced and so on (Retnasari & Hidayah, 2019).

In this case, it is one of the phenomena of religious conflict that occurs in the territory of our country. One of the things that a righteous nation does is to respect the diversity that exists in its region or environment wherever it is (Volman & Gilde, 2019). However, this religious issue seems to be unsolvable. In fact, as time goes by, this nation is getting stronger and more mature, so the mindset in preserving and tolerating religion and other diversity should be higher and owned by every citizen (Fasce & Avendano 2022). One of the traits that must be possessed by all Indonesian people is an attitude of tolerance (Heru Nurgiansah & Al Muchtar, 2018)

Based on surveys related to trends in social tolerance and diversity, it shows that the majority of men and women stated that citizens agree that they are free to practice any religion that is in accordance with what they believe, compared to men and women who agree with more women, namely with an average percentage of 74% while men as many as 26% in several Southeast Asian countries such as Brunei Darussalam, Malaysia, Singapore, Indonesia, and Thailand (Atari et al. 2023).

And based on the results of the survey which shows that the majority of Muslims are tolerant of neighbors with different groups, whether different in ethnicity, religion, or others, there is no significant difference between male and female respondents. Tolerance is one of the values contained in the foundation of the state, the value of tolerance will only become a rhetoric if it is not implemented in the life of the nation and state. Talking about the implementation of the value of tolerance, what must be prioritized is the implementation of starting from among young intellectuals (students) because they are the successors of the leadership relay of the nation in the future (Atari et al., 2023).

Basically, a campus or higher education institution is one of the institutions that implements the value of tolerance as taught in Pancasila, one of which can be formed by the existence of a Civic Education course which contains guidelines for citizens, especially in tolerance (Atari et al., 2023) These Pancasila values are made as mandatory courses that must be included at the university level so that it is hoped that these values remain inherent and become a direction in good behavior that is in accordance with the noble values of Pancasila which are expected to be applied in the joints of life such as hospitality, honesty, responsibility, manners, mutual respect, accepting the opinions of others who are different from each other. (2024), because Pancasila contains noble values that are used as a view and guideline for the life of the Indonesian people, including people at the university level such as students, especially in pre-service elementary school teachers. Therefore, there needs to be a deep understanding of tolerance awareness in accordance with Pancasila among Pre-service elementary school teachers, considering that PGSD is a study that is quite important and has an impact on the community when they graduate later to educate children in elementary school.

As prospective teachers, pre-service elementary school teachers should view all human beings as equal human beings with almost the same needs. So that the existence of intolerance in nutrition students can be seen as a bad thing (Heru Nurgiansah & Al Muchtar, 2018).

Based on the results of observations and interviews in March-April 2024 with Pre-service elementary school teachers at one of the universities, namely PGRI University Yogyakarta, there is a high awareness of tolerance between students, both from eastern tribes and those of different religions. Because in each class there are students from Papua who have different races, ethnicities, religions than the majority of students at PGRI Yogyakarta University and all students are very able to embrace and study together in higher education without excluding each other.

This is interesting to research because it is very rare for Generation Z to embrace and have a high sense of tolerance with fellow students who have ethnic, racial, religious, and cultural differences that are in accordance with Pancasila values (Aben, 2022). Therefore, this study will examine the implementation of civic education in self-awareness and tolerance taken through the values of Pancasila pre-service elementary school teachers at PGRI Yogyakarta University.

## ■ **METHOD**

### **Research Design and Procedures**

Qualitative research design with case study approach was used in this study (Brace, 2018). In-depth semi-structured interviews with open-ended questions were conducted with resource persons consisting of UPY pre-service elementary school teachers to gather diverse and detailed information on the values of Pancasila in self-awareness and tolerance among students about their perspectives. Pancasila values will later be discussed. implemented by applying the meaning of these values in everyday life.

### **Participants**

This research was conducted in Yogyakarta, Indonesia. A total of 70 UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers took part in this study who were in semester 2. Using purposive sampling, the study selected participants based on predetermined criteria. In the implementation of previous research, participants were given a detailed and systematic explanation of the objectives, procedures, impacts and benefits of this research. Participants were informed about data recording, including audio recordings during interviews and observations.

### **Instruments**

Based on the definitions above, it can be concluded that research instruments are tools used to obtain and collect research data, as a step to find results or conclusions from research without abandoning the criteria for making a good instrument. Instruments in a study are divided into two, namely test and non-test forms. Test instruments consist of psychological tests and non-psychological tests, while non-test instruments consist of questionnaires, interviews, observations, multilevel scales and documentation. This research uses non-test research instruments consisting of questionnaires and interviews.

The questionnaire in this study consists of 30 questions covering 3 indicators. These indicators are Pancasila values, Pancasila education, awareness and tolerance. Each indicator is represented by 10 questions. These three indicators were developed by the researchers themselves by adjusting existing variables. Meanwhile, the research instrument in the form of interviews conducted in this research was used to dig deeper into data regarding the implementation of Pancasila values to foster awareness and tolerance in PGSD students. Interviews in this research were conducted ranging from structured to unstructured questions.

The instrument test in this research will be carried out using a validity test. A valid instrument has high validity, whereas an instrument that is less valid means it has low validity. Testing the validity of the instrument in this research used a validity test by experts (expert judgment). Expert judgment is asking experts to examine the instrument and evaluate systematically whether the instrument items represent what is intended to be measured (Creswell, 2018).

Instruments are arranged based on an instrument grid that has been determined based on the theory used. The instrument that has been prepared is consulted with supervisors and experts in the field to obtain an assessment of whether the instrument is suitable for use, or whether improvements need to be made. The validators of this research instrument were 2 lecturers in education and psychology. Based on the assessment by experts/validators, the results showed that the instrument was declared valid and could be used for study

In this research, reliability testing was carried out by auditing the entire research process. This is done by an independent auditor, namely the supervising lecturer, to audit all of the researcher's activities in conducting research. How researchers start to determine the problem, enter the field, determine data sources, carry out data analysis, carry out validity tests and arrive at conclusions must be demonstrated by the researcher.

### **Data Analysis**

According to (Creswell, 2018), data analysis in qualitative research is carried out during data collection, and after completing data collection within a certain period. At the time of the interview, the researcher had analyzed the interviewee's answers. If the interviewee's answers after analysis feel unsatisfactory, the researcher will continue asking questions again, until a certain stage, data is obtained that is considered credible. Activities in data analysis,

namely data collection, data reduction, data presentation, and drawing conclusions and verification, are called the Miles and Huberman Model Data Analysis (Creswell, 2018).

### **Data Collection**

In qualitative research, data is collected using observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation or a combination of the three (triangulation). Collection in this study was carried out in approximately two weeks. At the beginning, the researcher carried out a general exploration of the social situation/object under study, everything that was seen and heard was recorded. In this way, researchers will obtain very large and very varied data.

### **Data Reduction**

According to (Creswell, 2018), there is quite a lot of data obtained from the field, so it needs to be recorded carefully and in detail. As has been stated, the longer the researcher is in the field, the greater the amount of data, complex and complicated, so that it is necessary to immediately analyze the data through data reduction. Researchers carry out data reduction by summarizing, sorting and selecting the main things, focusing on the important things, looking for themes and patterns.

### **Data Presentation**

In qualitative research, data presentation can be done in the form of brief descriptions, charts, relationships between categories, flowcharts, and the like. This research aims to present data using narrative text. By presenting data, it will be easier to understand what happened, plan further work based on what has been understood (Creswell, 2018).

### **Conclusion and Data Verification**

The initial conclusions put forward are still temporary, and will change if strong supporting evidence is not found at the next stage of data

collection. Then, if the conclusions put forward at the initial stage are supported by valid and consistent evidence when the researcher returns to the field to collect data, then the conclusions

put forward are credible conclusions. Thus, the conclusions in qualitative research are new findings that have never existed before.

**Table 1.** Respect for each different faith

No.	Factor	Self-Awareness and Tolerance
1	Diversity of religious communities	Respect every different belief
2	Ethnic diversity	Respect the culture and customs that are carried out.
3	Sociocultural diversity	Respect differences in economic, traditional and social backgrounds.
4	Diversity in Bhinneka Tunggal Ika	Uniting ethnicity, culture, language and religion in a motto

## ■ RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The results that can be obtained from the discussion of civic education research through self-awareness and tolerance in the application of Pancasila values to UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers include a summary of the discussion from the results of the Google Form survey and a summary of interviews with resource persons can be illustrated through the results of in-depth interviews. The sample data of respondents interviewed included from classes A3-23 named Nenni Aprilia from Java as Muslims, Ana Novita from Minangkabau as Muslims, Ristiyana from Java as Christians, Nur Ari from Java as Muslims, Andah Rossy from Papua as Catholics and Rahma Setya from Bangka as Muslims. The respondents interviewed in grades A4-23 named Anggita Septia came from Javanese Muslim, Muhammad Nur came from Java Muslim, Mia Mince came from Papua was Catholic, Aisah Putri came from Minangkabau was Muslim, and Seno Aji came from Bangka was Muslim.

It is explained that the majority of UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers have implemented self-awareness and tolerance which includes the values of Pancasila, mutual respect and respect between fellow students of different beliefs, ethnicities and cultures.

These activities are reflected in activities while on campus where each class has friends from various ethnicities, cultures and different religions with mutual tolerance and respect for others as an example of daily activities with students who have different beliefs respecting Muslim students to carry out Dzuhur or Asr prayers on campus. The discussion of beliefs is quite sensitive for the majority of people. The cause of disharmony between religious people is usually caused by aspects that are not in line and there is no tolerance between others, resulting in negative effects that trigger division.

Although the majority of respondents as many as 70 UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers have applied an attitude of self-awareness and tolerance among others, it does not deny that

there are still acts of religious, ethnic, and cultural discrimination around them (Sykes, 2020). This must be instilled in Pancasila values in life because we are social creatures who everywhere must be side by side with others and need each other.

The following is data on the diversity of UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers in classes A3-23 and A4-23 related to self-awareness and tolerance through pancasila values.

**Table 2.** UPY pre-service elementary school teachers diversity data

No.	Religious, Ethnic and Cultural Diversity	Journal of Progressive Education
1	<b>Religion :</b> Moslem <b>Ethnic :</b> Java <b>Culture :</b> Javanese language, tradition	54 students
2	<b>Religion :</b> Christian <b>Ethnic :</b> Java <b>Culture :</b> Javanese language, tradition	3 students
3	<b>Religion :</b> Catholic <b>Ethnic :</b> Java <b>Culture :</b> Javanese language, tradition	3 students
4	<b>Religion :</b> Catholic <b>Ethnic :</b> Papua <b>Culture :</b> Papua language, tradition	2 students
5	<b>Religion :</b> Moslem <b>Ethnic :</b> Minangkabau <b>Culture :</b> Minang language, Matrilineal system, tradition	2 students
6	<b>Religion :</b> Moslem <b>Ethnic :</b> Sawang, Bangka Belitung <b>Culture :</b> Malay language, tradition	5 students
<b>Total students</b>		<b>70 students</b>

Based on data collected through questionnaires and interviews, as many as 70 students majoring in Pre-service elementary school teachers UPY are predominantly Muslim with a total of 54 students coming from Javanese tribes and cultures that are often used in daily life with the use of Javanese. Students who are Christian and Catholic each number 3 students with Javanese tribes and daily culture using Javanese. From each class, there are 2 students from Papua who are Catholics with their daily culture, using Papuan language that adapts to Java Island, with various in the Yogyakarta area. Muslim students from Minangkabau with a culture using Minang language and traditions.

Finally, 5 Moslem students come from the Sawang tribe of Bangka Belitung with cultural habits using Malay language and its traditions.

This is because of the diversity of religions, ethnicities, and cultures among students majoring in Pre-service elementary school teachers UPY shows that they can coexist, respect each other, and respect each other between students who have different religions, tribes and cultures by making it an act of self-awareness and tolerance between fellow students who have differences. This makes a positive attitude maintained by students majoring in Pre-service elementary school teachers UPY to always maintain kinship tolerance between others.

### **Theme 1. Pancasila Values in Pancasila Education as a Solution to Foster Self-Awareness and Tolerance in Pre-service elementary school teachers**

Etymologically understanding the notion of implementation comes from English which means to implement. Webster's large dictionary implements means to provide a place to do something and to bring up the existence of cause and effect to a (Bahrudin 2019). According to McLaughlin and Schubert who explained that the notion of implementation is an activity that adjusts each other. These notions show that the word implementation boils down to activities, actions, actions or mechanisms of a system (Admanto, 2020). The expression mechanism means that implementation is not just an activity but a planned and arranged activity that is carried out definitively based on certain norms to achieve the objectives of the activity.

Implementation in the KBBI dictionary is an application or implementation. An activity that contains policies and innovations in practical actions so as to have a positive effect in the form of aspects of knowledge insight (cognitive), attitudes (affective) and skills (psychomotor). (Rosyid, 2019).

The diversity that occurs around, especially in the scope of university colleges, for example, students majoring in PGSD UPY have diversity that is not only diverse in ethnicity and race, but also from various beliefs believed by each individual. Self-awareness of tolerance makes the atmosphere harmonious in religious life in a pluralistic society. This is driven by the religious background formed because of tolerance and self-awareness applied to mutual respect and respect for these differences. (Satriawan et al., 2019).

Activities of cooperation and mutual assistance are carried out regardless of someone having social status, as well as in religion. Differences in Pre-service elementary school teachers can be found in social life, even they

often coexist. Examples of observations and interviews in classes A3-23 and A4-23 are students from Papua who are Christians. The student made good friends and sat always next to students from Java who were Muslims. This shows the self-awareness and tolerance that has been ingrained in UPY Pre-service elementary school teachers in accordance with expectations. (Nugraha et al., 2020).

Educational institutions are institutions that run and are responsible for educational activities for students (Jasmarnisa & Ersya, 2020). This diversity is often found in educational institutions, including differences in ethnicity, gender, religion, language, and others. Like PGRI University Yogyakarta majoring in PGSD, in each class there are students from various regions from Sabang to Merauke can be found in the class of students majoring in PGSD UPY. This encourages a positive impact for the university to blend different students to be able to while learning to foster self-awareness and tolerance through the values of pancasila civic education.

Some aspects of a positive attitude that are in accordance with the values of pancasila in life (Deti, 2021) include the application of the first precept which reads "One Godhead", that as individuals humans believe in the existence of God as their creator by carrying out all religious orders in accordance with the teachings held by each other's mutual respect by not imposing religious will on others and vice versa.

The second precept attitude which reads "Just and civilized humanity" that as individuals humans are treated equally without discriminating humans from one another based on religion, language, ethnicity, race, or economy because humans should be creatures created by God to uphold justice and truth, have equal rights and obligations and not be discriminatory humans with fellow humans.

The application of the third precept which reads "Indonesian Unity" that this attitude shows love for the Indonesian homeland by always

making the nation proud by maintaining the good name of the nation, upholding peace to create unity and unity in the environment.

The value of Pancasila in the fourth precept which reads "Peoplehood led by wisdom in representative deliberation" that this precept reflects for human behavior to deliberate to reach consensus. In this case, the importance of the community and nation is prioritized by conveying aspirations, respecting the opinions of others and prioritizing common interests (Simarmata, 2017).

The fifth precept which reads "Social justice for all Indonesian people" that this describes an attitude of self-awareness with examples of respecting the work of others, not intimidating, helping others as much as possible in accordance with one's own abilities and respecting the rights and obligations of others as social beings.

Therefore, universities must participate in upholding to build self-awareness and tolerance of one's differences in embracing and practicing a religion. Policies built in universities must pay attention to aspects of what the needs of students with various types of religions, beliefs, cultures, and tribes (Khakim & Nugraha, 2017)

With the diversity that arises among students majoring in PGSD UPY, it is important to be applied through the values of self-awareness and tolerance among fellow students with the hope that in students will grow self-awareness, mutual respect and respect for other students who have differences with themselves.

## **Theme 2. The Impact of the Implementation of Pancasila Values in Pancasila Education to Foster Self-Awareness and Tolerance in Pre-service elementary school teachers**

From the results of research at PGRI University Yogyakarta on students majoring in PGSD in implementing Pancasila values through citizenship education as an effort to foster self-awareness and tolerance that has a positive impact on the character of students majoring in PGSD

UPY which means through the implementation of Pancasila education carried out in the elementary school PPKn course through the Semester Learning Plan (RPS), Lecture Event Unit (SAP), Systems, practices, presentations applied at every meeting in each semester in the Pancasila education course at PPKn SD provide good and maximum results. (Dania, 2022). This leads to a high sense of self-awareness and tolerance towards every student who has diversity in the UPY PGSD major.

Activities to implement self-awareness and tolerance through Pancasila values are expected to run continuously and not limited to Pancasila education, but should with Pancasila education (Van der Aar et al, 2018) which is a basic subject become a gateway to the sustainability of activities manifesting the implementation of Pancasila education in forming self-awareness and tolerance of students of basic and main potential for today and the future (Atari et al. 2023).



**Figure 1.** Pre-service elementary school teachers A4-23 group work

In the image of the activity above, it is shown that pre-service elementary school teachers in grades A4-23 have a sense of tolerance with others. They do not discriminate between friends on the religion, culture, race, and ethnicity that each individual has. This awareness makes pre-service elementary school teachers always compact and solid in carrying out lecture activities on campus.





**Figure 2.** Pre-service elementary school teachers A3-23 discuss

In the picture, pre-service elementary school teachers conduct a group discussion about the material to be discussed to be presented in front of the class. The group division was carried out randomly and each pre-service elementary school teacher gathered with their respective groups regardless of friends who had a diversity of religion, culture, race, and ethnicity. They view all the same and the awareness of tolerance has been well applied in this class.

It is hoped that this implementation can develop and be carried out to form self-awareness and tolerance not only for students but for all academic communities (Sahal et al. 2018). Based on the theories and opinions above in this study has analyzed the need for character building that must be possessed by students such as noble character, competitive, moral, tolerance, self-awareness, patriotic, dynamic, cultured and have a sense of care for the development of science and technology based on Pancasila values.

Pancasila education must be instilled in every student in higher education to maintain the unity of the nation's integrity and the cultivation of good character (Leeuw, 2023). Currently, Indonesia is experiencing a crisis of character that has lost its national identity. The loss of national identity that respects and values diversity that coexists with different ethnicities, cultures, tastes, and religions (Biesta, 2020). Learning about

pancasila education is important and becomes a foundation that must be applied to each individual human being in order to have self-awareness and a sense of care for others. (Nambung et al., 2021)

## ■ CONCLUSION

Based on the results and discussion, it can be concluded that this research through pancasila education by implementing and pouring in the form of daily and sustainable actions has been carried out with self-awareness and tolerance among fellow students majoring in PGSD UPY which is pluralism rather than just delivering theories without reciprocity with real actions taken by students that have a positive impact on the surrounding community.

Activities in cultivating and increasing self-awareness through Pancasila values form an attitude of tolerance not only in Pancasila education courses but are carried out continuously at every level of semester to be taken.

The impact provides positive things, namely increasing a sense of care for fellow students in need, mutual respect and respect in any case, (De Ruyter & Schinkel, 2017) the creation of harmonious togetherness without discriminating ethnicity, race, and religion which is diversity which is always a positive value to strengthen the pluralism among students.

## ■ REFERENCES

- Aben, J., E., J., Anneke C., T., Filitsa, D., Mayra M., L., & Jan-Willem, S. (2022) What influences students' peer-uptake? relations between error tolerance and feedback tolerance. *Learning and Individual Differences*. 97(4): 2-6
- Admanto, N.E. (2020). Religious tolerance of madrasah aliyah students in kendal regency, central java. *SMaRT Journal*, 6(2), 215–118
- Ahmed, G K., Metwaly, N. A., Elbeh, K., Galal,

- M. S., & Shaaban, I. (2022). Risk factors of school bullying and its relationship with psychiatric comorbidities: a literature review. *Egyptian Journal of Neurology, Psychiatry and Neurosurgery*, 58(1).
- Alfarisi, D. S., Ramdan, E., Kabir, F. F., & Azzahra, U. H. (2021). Dedication to building self-awareness in an ecological frame as an effort to restore natural balance with the mulgara community. 25, 60–71.
- Althof, W., & Berkowitz, M. W. (2019). Moral education and character education: Their relationship and roles in citizenship education. *Journal of Moral Education*, 35(4), 67-70
- Atari, M., Haidt, J., Graham, J., Koleva, S., Stevens, S. T., & Dehghani, M. (2023). Morality beyond the WEIRD: How the nomological network of morality varies across cultures. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, 125(5), 1157–1188.
- Bahrudin, f. A. (2019). Implementation of competencies in civic education courses in universities in facing the challenges of globalization. *Pro patria: journal of education, civics, law, social, and politics*, 2(2), 184–200.
- Banks, J. A. (2017). Failed citizenship and transformative civic education. *Educational Researcher*, 46(7), 34-36.
- Biesta, G.J.J. (2020). Burgerschapsvorming: Pedagogische en levensbeschouwelijke eigenheid op het democratisch speelveld [Citizenship education: Pedagogical and ideological individuality on the democratic playground; White paper]. Verus, vereniging voor katholiek en christelijk onderwijs., 56(4), 123-125
- Brace, I. (2018). Questionnaire design: how to plan, structure, and write survey material for effective market research. In *Kogan Page* (Vol. 6). Kogan Page.
- Conrad, L. Y., Demasson, A., Gorichanaz, T., & VanScoy, A. (2019). Exploring card sort methods: Interaction and implementation for research, education, and practice. *Proceedings of the Association for Information Science and Technology*, 56(1), 525–528.
- Creswell, John W & J. David Creswell. (2018). *Research design qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches fifth edition*. SAGE Publications, Inc.
- Daria, d. (2022). Pancasila as a paradigm in maintaining inter-religious harmony in Indonesia (case study in Pancur Village, Lingga Regency). *Participatory journal*, 4(2).
- Deti, s., & dewi, d. A. (2021). Implementation of Pancasila values to prevent radicalism in Indonesia. *Edumaspul: educational journal*, 5(1), 557–564.
- De Ruyter, D., & Schinkel, A. (2017). Ethics education at the university: From teaching an ethics module to education for the good life. *Bord ò on. Revista de pedagogia*, 69(4), 125–138.
- Emily Johnson. (2021). The impact of civic education on citizen participation. *Journal of Political Science*, 14(1), 1–13.
- Fasce, A., & Avendano, P D. (2022). Attitudes toward civil liberties and rights among politically charged online groups. *Social Psychology*, 53(4), 233–243.
- Fitriani, S. (2020). Diversity and tolerance between religious communities. *Analysis : Journal of Islamic Studies*, 20(2), 179–192
- Foundation, w. & l. S. I. (2018). National survey report on trends in socio-religious tolerance among Indonesian Muslim women. *Wahid foundation, results of surv (January 2018)*.
- Gao, W., Xiaolan Z, & Dawei, X. (2024). Spatial patterns, factors and ethnic differences : a

- study on ethnic minority in yunnan, china. *Heliyon*, 10 1-5
- Hadi, S. (2017). *Checking the validity of qualitative research data in thesis. Journal of Educational Sciences*, 21–24
- Heru nurgiansah, t., & al muchtar, s. (2018). Development of student awareness through student learning jurisprudential model in citizenship education. *Proceedings of the annual civic education conference*
- Jasmarnisa, t. J., & ersya, m. P. (2018). The influence of the gem program on the insight of student nationality at Padang State University. *Journal of civic education*, 1(2), 181–188.
- Khakim, M. S., & Nugraha, A. F. (2017). *Students as agents of tolerance* in building religious rights laws and policies at diy islamic universities. *Journal of Legal Science*, 11(1), 16–30.
- Leeuw, R., R. (2023). Student reflection on the curriculum and citizenship education using card sorting in group settings. *International Journal of Education Research Open*.
- Llopart, M., Serra, J. M., & Esteban-Guitart, M. (2018). Teachers' perceptions of the benefits, limitations, and areas for improvement of the funds of knowledge approach. A qualitative study. *Teachers and Teaching*, 24(5), 571–583.
- Miles, B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldana, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook*. los angeles: SAGE Publications.
- Mustari, M. (2019). *Character values: reflections for education* (M. T. Rahman, Ed.; 1st ed.). Jakarta: PT Rajagrafindo Persada.
- Nambung, M. N., setiani, p. P., & kurniawan, f. (2021). Survival strategy of motor rickshaw drivers in the city of Malang. *Proceedings of the national seminar ikip budi utomo*, 2(01), 562– 572.
- Nugraha, I., Maslihah, S., & Misbach, I. H. (2020). Critical thinking skills and their role in high school students' religious tolerance. *Mediation*, 6(2), 119–131.
- Pace, J. L. (2019). Contained risk-taking: Preparing preservice teachers to teach controversial issues in three countries. *Theo.Res.Soc.Edu.*, 47(2), 228–260.
- Retnasari, I., & hidayah, y. (2019). Fostering nationalism of young citizens in the era of globalization through civic education in higher education (study on UAD PGSD students). *Basicedu journal*, 4(1), 79–88.
- Sahal, M., Musadad, A., A., & Akhyar, M. (2018). Tolerance in multicultural education : a theoretical concept. *international journal of multicultural and multireligious understanding*. Vol. 8 11-122
- Satriawan, i., islami, m. N., & lailam, t. (2019). Prevention of radicalism movement through the cultivation of pancasila ideology and community-based constitutional conscious culture. *Journal of Solar Society*, 1(2), 99.
- Simarmata & Henry, T. (2017) *Indonesia emerald tolerance*. South Jakarta: PSIK-Indonesia.
- Sutiyono, s. (2018). Reformulation of pancasila and citizenship education to strengthen nationalism of young citizens in border areas. *Citizenship Journal of Pancasila and Citizenship*, 6(1), 1.
- Sykes, B., & Kuyper, H. (2020). School segregation and the secondary-school achievements of youth in the Netherlands. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 39(10), 23-27
- Van der Aar, L. P. E., Peters, S., & Crone, E. A. (2018). The development of self-views across adolescence: Investigating self-descriptions with and without social comparison using a novel experimental paradigm. *Cognitive Development*, 48, 256–270.

- Volman, M., & 't Gilde, J. (2021). The effects of using students' funds of knowledge on educational outcomes in the social and personal domain. *Learning, Culture and Social Interaction*, 28.
- Zakharin, M., & Timothy C., B. (2024). Psychological pillars of support for free speech : tolerance for offensive. disagreeing, social divisive, and heterodox speech. *Personality and Individual Differences*. 291(2) 1-3