

Holmes' reformulation through elements of femininity in Enola Holmes

Marssy Diana Sampe

Master Program of Literature, Faculty of Cultural Sciences, Universitas Gadjah Mada, Indonesia

Correspondence: marssydianasampe485067@mail.ugm.ac.id

Abstract

As time goes by, fiction has become a medium that satisfies people's wishes. This phenomenon happens because the purpose of popular fiction is to fulfill people's demands of plot lines. Therefore, the storyline or narrative of the story is a crucial point in discussing popular fiction. Genre becomes the key point in discussing the formulation of a story. This formulation is based on convention and one of the famous formulations is the genre of detective. One of the famous works of detectives is Sherlock Holmes. Holmes has created his own world and has produced so many adaptations. One of the adaptations that hooked people's attention is a spin-off work of Sherlock Holmes, Enola Holmes. Enola Holmes is a novel series written by Springer that got recognition from many people because she wrote a story on the line of Sherlock Holmes's canonical story. Due to the fame, this series got adapted into film as Jack Thorne rewrote the story based on the original. However, Enola—written by Springer and Thorne—represents a contra point in the formulation. In order to discover and prove the formulation, this study focuses on using genre criticism focusing on the formulation of feminist in the objects. Furthermore, this study also uses genre theories by Cawelti and Gelder in conducting the discussion. This research proves that Enola is a detective story by following the classical detective formula following the original formulation by Doyle on Sherlock. The problem of contra point is represented in the invention or innovation of the detective genre as it is taking women as the detective and main villain and a mystery around women characters.

Keywords: Enola Holmes, Genre, Detective, Sherlock, Formula

Introduction

Along with the times and the influence of the industrial revolution, fiction or popular works have become media that people enjoy. Popular fiction is a type of popular culture that functions to fulfil people's wishes. According to Adi (2011) and Nachbar & Lause (1992), popular fiction creates dreams for its audience, and these dreams are demands of the audience that must be met. Due to this reason, the reader or connoisseur of popular fiction is an important element in seeing the success or popularity of a work. Because the main goal is to satisfy the

reader or society, popular works tend to present conventional values that have been seen from cultural practices that exist in society (William, 1997).

In popular works, the storyline is an important component to captivate the reader so as to present a specification called genre. This is said by Gelder (2004, p.40) that popular fiction is basically genre fiction composed of generic conventional conceptions and written based on plots to suit certain genres and to appeal to modern readers. According to William (1997, p.180) genre is a collection of conventional value representations in literary writing, but not an ideal type or technical order (185) because the form of the genre itself changes according to the development of people's interests and desires in the story plot. This is what causes the genre to be very flexible and often undergo reforms or the addition of new variation components to it. This distinction lies in the main points of the story, namely the formula that is the main difference between one story and another. Gelder describes eight main genres in popular works, one of which is crime fiction which deals with the world of mystery, detectives, criminals, and so on.

Crime mythology, according to Cawelti (1971, 51; 1975, p. 521 & 524), was born long ago even before the heyday of the Crime Fiction genre in 1887 and 1913. The mythology of crime becomes a public belief so it becomes a convention and is used as data by fiction writers in making stories (Cawelti, 1976, p. 50 and Adi, 2016, p. 212). Cawelti (1976, p. 80) asserts that due to cultural changes in the understanding of myths in the crime genre, there are many different formulas in it that make the genre more varied. Even though variations presented, such as melodrama, adventure, and romance became the convention of the crime fiction genre but the core of the Crime genre lies in the original story with the theme of detective, crime, police, investigation, and case-solving (Ida, 2016, p. 201; Cawelti, 1976, p. 80). This opinion is in line with Gelder (2004, p. 55) who stated that the world of Crime Fiction is related to the world of men, mysteries, detectives, criminals, and so on. Therefore, it can be said that the crime genre pivots on mystery detective story plots that focus on solving cases.

The mystery-detective genre is one that is well-established and has its own world and audience. The classic detective story was first introduced by Edgar Allan Poe in the 1840s. Although he did not bring the detective genre to prominence, Poe's narration of the detective character Dupin made a major impact in the formulation of the classic detective story that was later followed by other writers. One of the popular works that brought fame to the detective genre was Sherlock Holmes. Sherlock Holmes is one of the most popular fictional characters ever. There is a sentence that said if Poe was the inventor of the detective novel, it was Arthur Conan Doyle who really established the detective as a popular genre (Crrlstaff, 2018). According to Readmikenow (2022) and

Crrlstaff (2018) the character of Sherlock Holmes—a private detective—was created by Sir Conan Doyle because he was inspired by the character Dupin—who is an amateur detective—and also an individual named Dr. Joseph Bell. The first Sherlock Holmes novel, *A Study in Scarlet* appeared in 1887, and Doyle continued to write Sherlock Holmes novels and short stories until about 1927 to date, more than 60 million copies have been sold and not to mention comic adaptations, children's books, rewritten versions, and translations.

Holmes' fame is increasing with the presence of adaptations in various types, namely web series, tv series, films, books, radio, theatre performances, illustrations, comics, anime, and children's books. Cronin (2023) and Hill (2020) state that there have been 254 film adaptations of Sherlock Holmes and more than 150 adaptations of the novels. One popular work that is famous for linking narrative with the Sherlock Holmes canon is *Enola Holmes*, written by Nancy Springer. The *Enola Holmes* travel collection, especially in its first book—*An Enola Holmes the Case of the Missing Marquess*—received a lot of attention from Holmes fans because of the female characters and the problems conveyed such as mystery, code-puzzle, women as the main characters. The popularity of this novel does not stop at the book collection but continues in the form of a film adaptation on the Netflix service in 2020 and 2022 with the title *Enola Holmes*. Springer (Bhattacharya, 2020)—in his interview—made *Enola* complement what Sir Arthur Conan Doyle did not present in his masterpiece—that is, men are dominated and the world is women. From this deficiency, Springer presents *Enola* to fill Sherlock and Mycroft Holmes' deficiencies in the world of detectives with the views of women who are always underestimated by their brothers and the importance of women and their little things that have never been brought up in the Sherlock Holmes Novel series. Springer describes *Enola* and *Eudoria* as characters who feel that dress codes and other constructs support burdensome and even discriminate against individuals in exercising their freedom. This novel emphasizes the development and changes in the new world of detectives, especially in the composition of the Holmes family which presents different, interesting, and unique components. but still sticks to the elements of the old detective formula. Many readers (Goodreads) see the theme factors above and agree with the theme of women's problems in the construction of femininity that is included in the world of the mystery detective Sherlock Holmes. The reader's understanding of the genre as well as the formula and context of society presented by the author regarding the tastes of certain people is the basis for popular fiction which is said to be successful (Chandler in Adi, 2011) and it is from here that researchers see research opportunities.

Anggraini & Retnaningdyah (2022) in their journal *Women's Rebellion to Find Voices in Enola Holmes*, examine a comparison of the character *Eudoria Holmes* who rebelled in the battle for votes in the Victorian era against the film

Enola Holmes and the novel *an Enola Holmes: The Case of Missing Marquess*. This journal explains that the Eudoria Holmes revolt was a form of rejection of the values of Victorian society at three levels, namely individual, family, and social which constrained women. Furthermore, Sakinah et al. (2022) in the journal *Characterization of Enola Holmes in The Case of Missing Marquess: A Study of Liberal Feminism* discusses oppression and limitation that occurred to women in the 19th century. The journal concludes that Enola tried to rebel against the oppression through her actions. Her masculine appearance and actions contradict normative beauty standards for the 19th-century tradition. Her critical and logical thinking that challenges stereotypical gender roles, which position women as less intelligent than men, is also considered strange by society. The third research was conducted by Paananen (2021) with the title *Representation of gender roles in the novel an Enola Holmes #1: The Case of Missing Marquess and its Netflix film adaptation*. Paananen found that there are three elements from the analysis of the two objects, namely the representation of Enola's character in the dialogue between the characters, and in the linguistic description of the novel, and the visual elements of the film. This study concludes that the representation in the film adaptation is more radical than in the novel in the depiction of her rebel characteristics. The latest research with a similar form is of thesis research entitled *Reformulating Dracula in the Early 21st Century: Genre Analysis of 24 Vampire Films* (Fuanda, 2015). Fuanda found that of the 24 Dracula films produced from 2000-2014, most of them used a combination of genres, not only full Dracula, but from a combination of pure horror, action, drama, adventure, sci-fiction, and romance. In addition, the researchers also found that there were 5 new formulas, emphasizing the elements of science and fusion of sex elements, changing motives, changing antagonists to become heroes, women as heroes, and changing property. Differences between this study with previous studies is conducted into finding the development of the structure of the Enola Holmes genre formula, especially in the invention with its relation to the sociocultural construction of the 21st century. Specifically, this section presents several literature reviews that have relevance to material objects as well as formal objects.

Methods

This article is based on genre analysis research that focuses on elements of the feminine formula narrated in Enola Holmes. According to Kristi (2001), genre criticism is the study of forms or types of literature. Genre studies often focus on the characteristics, structures, and conventions associated with various forms of literature, for example, the novel, short story, poetry, drama, film, and so on. More recent investigations into genre criticism have centred on biases often inherent in genre criticism such as latent racism and sexism. Therefore, it can

be concluded that genre criticism research is centred on conventional society created in the form of fictional writing by writers and community conventions based on beliefs and issues circulating. This is also in line with the perspective of gender criticism which is seen as a socially and culturally constructed phenomenon that occurs at many levels in society and organizations (Paechter, 2007, p. 12). Seeing this description, Adi (2016, p. 204) says that genre research is carried out by looking at aspects of its construction, namely historical aspects, archetypes, and readers' interests.

This research is descriptive-qualitative research that utilizes library data. The research method is divided into two, namely data collection methods and data analysis methods. In the data collection process, the researcher used a purposive method. According to Lyons and Doueck (2010, p. 10), a purposive method is carried out on data based on the objectives desired by the researcher. The researcher chose to use the novel *an Enola Holmes: The Case of the Missing Marquess* by Nancy Springer, which was published in 2006 because this book is the first in a series that directly contains the development of the mystery genre with a more varied formula from the world of detectives and at the same time opens the world of Enola Holmes' journey. The beginning of this story is what determines the development of the invention of Doyle's Holmes. The object of the film was chosen with the same method and goal because the popularity of the novel was getting bigger, so there was a film that also brought the novel's work to even greater fame. The next process after seeing the components above in the material object is reading and viewing the primary data that has been determined. After the reading process, the researcher conducted, searched, and collected data. The data collected is in the form of narration, dialogue, and sentences, related to the detective genre and the formula concept. For the analysis method, the researcher used the collected data alongside the theory in order to answer the objection of the study by proving that Enola Holmes is a genre detective yet also reformulating the genre detective itself.

The analysis process is a research technique that is an extension of thinking that aims to find relationships between data (Faruk, 2012, p. 25). This is intended so that the data is interpreted in accordance with research theory from a literature study perspective. According to George (2008), library research is a method of collecting data by studying and understanding data that is closely related to problems from books, theories, and documents, where the data taken is in the form of primary data. After the data is collected, sampling will be carried out using purposive sampling, which is a method in which sample data is collected through various sources that are representative and in accordance with theory (Arikunto in Lenaini, 2021, p. 34).

Results and Discussion

Cawelti (1971, p. 51; 1975, p. 521 & 524) said the foundation of the detective genre which discusses elements of crime, criminals, detectives, and mysteries is rooted in the mythology of crime that existed long ago even before 1887. The mythology of crime is always associated with crime, murder, assault, and so on. Gelder (2004, p. 53-56) said that at the beginning of its spread Crime Fiction was different from other main genres such as adventure, and romance. The work that uses the theme of crime fiction lives in the realm of literature with the keyword 'reference', which means that this genre only enters the reader's circle if the book has received a 'preface' from other crime fiction writers and this work is only enjoyed by certain circles who are interested in it the formula that this genre offers. Therefore, this genre does not quickly reach its golden age like other genres. It was Edgar Allan Poe through his work in 1840 who started stories that focused on detectives and this genre rose to prominence in the late nineteenth century with the popularity of Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes stories and Agatha Christie's works.

Cawelti (1976, pp. 81-85) states that although Poe's work did not bring the detective genre to its popularity, Poe—through his work—offered a story pattern that later became the foundation for Doyle, Christie, and other detective story writers, the type of story in question is a classic detective story. According to Todorov (1966) and Koliosa (2019, p. 105), the classic detective story or so-called *whodunit* is a short and suspenseful account of a murder investigation. The investigation is carried out by the detective in this case the police inspector, private investigator, or at least by an amateur. The writer must adhere to certain conventions and, above all, provide the reader with all the collusive clues and excuses used by the detective to solve the mystery. Traditionally, this type of story begins with a murder that disturbs the peace of life of people belonging to the middle or upper classes. In the investigation process, there is a disclosure of the weaknesses and limitations of all characters. However, from the moment detectives provide the name of the real culprit, this act seems highly significant and morally important to fixing everything.

Based on the theme of *whodunit* detective storytelling, Cawelti (1976, p. 81-85) explains that Poe divides the formulation of classic stories into 4 characteristics; situations, patterns of action, characters and relationships between them, and the setting that suits the characters and their actions. Cawelti (1976, p. 81-82) briefly explained that the situation relates to the beginning of the story which is marked by the emergence of a mystery whether it is a murder or a criminal or missing. The pattern of action in the detective story formula is centred on detective investigation and crime solutions. This action pattern is divided into 6 interconnected forms; a) detective introduction; b) crimes and leads; c) investigations; d) announcement of solutions; e)

explanation of solutions; and f) settlement (end of story). The third characteristic, namely the characters and their relationships, is divided by Cawelti (1976, p. 91-92) into 4 main characters—which must be combined and managed properly according to their function—namely, a) victims; b) the criminal, c) the detective; d) the character that must be assisted in solving the crime. The last formula explained is the setting (Cawelti, 1976, p 96-105). Setting in the world of the detective genre refers to the scene, atmosphere, and time. These three parts are united by one big theme, namely a tense and gloomy nuance when entering the plot of the emergence of mysteries, the strangeness of cases, the investigation process, gathering clues, and revealing the perpetrators by the detective.

In his research, Koliosa (2019, p. 2015) found that the type of *whodunit* stories created in the first period of the Golden Age could be reduced to mystery and this formulation was very popular and inspired detective story writers. Writers create the most elaborate murders and give detectives the glimmer of genius that allows them to discover the truth. This type of story was followed by many great writers such as Sir AC Doyle, who created the character S. Holmes and his assistant Dr. Watsons; Christie who implements Miss Marple and inspector H. Poirot and his assistant Hastings; DL Sayers who created Lord P. Wimsey. Therefore, it can be concluded that this formulaic pattern has become a convention and inspires writers to create stories that suit the tastes of the audience while not forgetting the essentials of detective stories involving mysteries-detectives-and one crime story that has become an iconic detective figure is Sherlock Holmes. Holmes is a very familiar name in the world of the detective genre, even Sherlock Holmes has become a genre in itself, judging by the many connoisseurs of Conan Doyle's works and also the many dozens of adaptations of these detective fiction work. One of the works that follow Doyle's *whodunit* storytelling pattern in Sherlock is the fiction of Enola Holmes.

Enola Holmes is one of the spin-off works of the canonical Sherlock Holmes. Enola Holmes is fiction in the mystery genre created by Nancy Springer which later from this collection of stories was adapted to the big screen and rewritten by Jack Thorne. The Enola Holmes story received a lot of criticism but still progressed to become a popular work and was in demand when it was broadcast because it showed something different with innovative plots and interesting issues.

As one of the spin-off stories that use the character Sherlock Holmes in it, the Enola Holmes formulation must show the classic detective story formulation as written by Doyle. Formulations that express regularity are conventions as William (1997, p. 180) said conventional values are a collection of beliefs or identical things that people agree on certain things. This convention formula is then explained by Cawelti in the 4 characteristics of the detective genre above.

In the book *The Case of the Missing Marquess* and the first film in the series, Enola enjoys life with her mother but then has to deal with the mystery of Eudoria sudden disappearance. This formulation is also presented in the 2nd Enola film, Enola lives quietly in hiding and works as a private detective focusing on *Perditorian* or missing person cases before then being confronted with the very complicated Sarah Chapman case. The beginning of this story, in line with whodunit exposure and also the classic detective story pattern is part of the situation. Furthermore, the story moves towards the pattern of case investigation actions.

The detective—Enola—tries to find evidence by asking people directly related to the victim. This indicates the initial process of clues (Cawelti, 1976, p. 83) that a detective will seek and investigate the scene of the incident. This process is also carried out in every Sherlock Holmes story by Doyle. In the investigation process, detectives often face difficulties in analysing clues and looking for common threads (Cawelti, 1976, p. 85). Cawelti also stated that the detective often makes mistakes in deduction about the perpetrator of the crime. This formulation is shown in Enola Holmes regarding her trying hard to investigate the case of the disappearance of the Marquess and Sarah Chapman. Enola gets a lot of evidence and also finds out what the criminal actually does and what the victim avoids. Enola manages to find out that the Marquess's family is involved in a case in order to seize the throne and Enola suspects his uncle as the next heir as the culprit. This is also depicted in the 2nd film; Enola discovers the truth of Sarah's disappearance related to the loss of evidence of factory fund corruption committed by Lord McIntyre. Alongside the evidence pointing to Lord McIntyre, Enola assumes that the Lord is the culprit.

The next process is the disclosure and resolution of the case, Enola realizes that she is being played by the real criminal. In the formulation of criminal characteristics, Cawelti (1976, p. 67) explained that the characteristics of criminals in classic detective stories are always described as people who are cunning, clever, and use any means to cover up their behaviour. The villain is also always the person the reader does not anticipate. This formulation proves in the film that the main villain in the case of the disappearance of the Marquess is his grandmother. The grandmother really hated the idea of the liberals who try to change British law which was centred on the power of the Lords. Her first child (Marquess' father) and the Marquess were liberal thinkers then this made the grandmother devise a plan to kill the Marquess as heir after his father died. The grandmother used her second child (uncle) who also hated liberal thinkers as a shield. Similar to the Sarah Chapman case, the main perpetrators were Mira Troy (Moriarty) or Lord McIntyre's secretary.

From all the brief discussions above, it can be seen that Enola Holmes is a detective genre story. However, the Enola Holmes story received a lot of

controversy due to the innovation or reformulation that was carried out regarding the classic story genre that was tied to Sherlock Holmes. Furthermore, the fundamental principle of mystery stories is the world of men, investigation, and discovery of hidden secrets. This finding usually gives an advantage to the character identified by the connoisseur (Cawelti, 1976, p. 42-44). Agreeing with Cawelti's opinion, Gelder (2004, p. 57) says that the formula of the popular mystery genre story lies in the investigation, the world of men, and the discovery of secrets that usually provide clues and benefits for the characters and the readers. Reddy (2003, p. 191) asserts that this happened because initially the determination of detective fiction was always known as a movement from man to man where writing was only made by men and through male observation. This is caused by the domination of male writers and language and cultural literacy which is centred on the construction of masculinity in the Victorian era.

From the explanation regarding the detective genre and story plot formulation, it can be concluded that a detective story must follow the existing formulation. In the early pattern, as Reddy said, the characteristic story formula is the world of men. In its development, after going through a very long period with the conventions of classic detective stories that emphasize the mysteriousness of the plot, and disclosure of the guilty and clever detective characters in solving cases, the 20th century gave a different picture of the detective figure, especially in American culture. The 20th century detective genre and mysterious fiction marked the addition of adventurous and melodramatic formulations to story conventions. Not apart from the establishment of this convention, the 20th century dismantled the view of detective stories on a hard and strong figure. The characteristics of 20th century detective stories are based on American culture and social development which are known as American Hard-boiled detective stories or hard-boiled detective stories related to gangsters. Even though reached another new formula in the 20th century, Cawelti (1976) still asserts that in the early 20th century, the detective story genre- including hardboiled-was still male-centric. Female characters have been portrayed in the story, but only as male helpers in capturing men or in the mission of seducing the perpetrator to come out of hiding. Women are still used as tools rather than the main characters

As its development approached the end of the 20th century or around 1950 and began to emerge in the 1980s (Barnett, 2017). This event coincided with the development of the issue of the first wave of feminists who upheld equal rights in society. This is in line with Grady's opinion that first-wave feminism is a number of feminist activities and thoughts in the late 19th and early 20th centuries around the world. First-wave feminism was dedicated to achieving equal political rights for women (the right to vote); fought for equal opportunities to get an education, jobs, and the right to own property.

The novel and film of Enola Holmes were made by Springer and Thorne in the 21st century but have a 19th-century theme because it follows the setting of Sherlock Holmes. As stated in his interview regarding the release of the first Enola Holmes film, Springer (Bhattacharya, 2020) says that he made Enola to complement what Sir Arthur Conan Doyle did not present in his masterpiece—namely, male dominance and the world of women and also because Sherlock's narration was very misogynistic. Martin (2023) and Bhattacharya (2020) added that throughout the Holmes story, the man does not have a very good opinion of women in general. During his deductions, Holmes often makes broad generalizations about women who by today's standards could be considered misogynistic. Based on this reason and the problem of women's femininity or genre equality which is still being felt in the 21st century, this is the reason why Springer made the story.

Overhauling the formulation with new innovations in female characters who are firm, strong, and smart is the main point that Springer conveys. This was also conveyed in a study conducted by Sakinah et al. (2022). Indeed, the problem presented in the novel depends on the issue of women's liberation for individual freedom. As explained in Emsley et al. (2021), British Literature Wiki (n.d), as well as articles published by Hughes (2014) and Claire (2010), England since the time of Christianity has lived according to gender roles created to distinguish between good and bad values. evil and has an impact on the formation of "unwritten" rules about roles that must be embedded by every society in order to be accepted. Initial expectations include the most basic thing in physical distinction, namely how to dress. Rules on how to dress have existed since Roman times, which were originally only for nobles but spread to all citizens and settled as a necessity in order to meet the criteria of being beautiful and dashing. Women were required to wear steel corsets, hip supports, hairstyles, wearing handkerchief hats, and others to look beautiful like queen Victoria. From the existence of a very strict dress code so as not to be considered strange and accepted, the problem of the construction of femininity began to emerge. In novels and films, the author very clearly describes the structure of caste differences between men and women. Women must attend girls' schools in order to learn to be a lady, marry and become mothers and have children who must be taught according to their gender. Gender in this case is understood as male and female (Springer, 2006, p. 8, 26, 45, 53, 66-67).

Yet there it was: She had been weak as well as strong. She had felt as trapped as I did. She had felt the injustice of her situation just as keenly. She had been forced to obey, as I would have been forced to obey. She had wanted to rebel, as I desperately yearned to rebel... But in the end, she had managed it. Glorious rebellion (Springer, 2006, p. 48).

Lord McIntyre: How dare you take advantage of your position!

Mira Troy: I take advantage? What were my advantages? Treated like a common servant when I have twice the mind of yours. Why shouldn't I have a share of your ill-begotten riches and punish you at the same time? Why shouldn't I be rewarded for what I can do? Where is my place in this society? I am a woman. I cannot join clubs, I cannot own shares, I cannot advance myself as they can, so I found my own way and it was fun. (1:50:04-1:51:10)

The dialogue and narrative evidence above clearly illustrate how women are regulated, not only in the way they dress but the way they live, who are entangled and confined in a cage. This is in line with Beauvoir (1956, p.107) who stated that both women are married and those who still live with their fathers. They do not enjoy human dignity; they have nothing but part of male inheritance. They only live like husband slaves, beasts of burden, or servants, only living to listen and do what men ask them to do.

The role of women in novels apart from teaching issues related to the construction of femininity, and Enola Holmes shows that women can also play an important role as the main character who regulates the storyline that indirectly regulates men in carrying out their duties very neatly. The explanation above proves that this investment destroys and creates a contrast with the male-centric detective genre for the sake of voicing hot issues in society. Kristi (2001) also stated the same that genre criticism sees the context of sexist issues in the novel as a new innovation. Enola's character escapes and lives in freedom by becoming a *Perditorian detective* and proving that women can enter the realm of men's world. Mira Troy or Moriarty is also a contra form to the character Moriarty the enemy of Sherlock in canonical works. Described with the same cunning and evil, Moriarty in Enola Holmes is portrayed as a female character. The narrative and invention in this story are contrary to the opinion of Cawelti and Reddy who say that the detective genre is a male genre work.

From this, it can be seen that, in narrating the detective pattern by mixing it with contrasting narratives, namely women as the main character and the main problem. This is done in order to dismantle old formulations and give new freshness to the reader. This opinion is in line with Adi (2016, p. 205) that in a genre there must be novelty and familiarity to make the story more interesting. Familiarity is a convention that structures story narratives according to available patterns and novelty is an invention that functions to provide new nuances related to problems and the latest information in the world.

As explained that novelty in a genre function as a response to changing circumstances and new information about world issues. The issue of the world or the role of women in society is very limited. Based on Phipps (2021) and IrishAid (2011) in the UK there are still many cases of gender inequality that occur, especially for some women, especially in underdeveloped or poor

communities and groups of colour women. This has been exacerbated by the COVID-19 pandemic, which has placed a disproportionate burden on women. Data proves that only 35% of board members in the largest public companies are women and only 35% of UK counsellors are women. A 2021 survey of what Britons think is the most serious type of inequality in the UK shows that most respondents favour inequality of income and wealth (56%) and inequality between richer and poorer areas (51%). This opinion is in line with the explanation by Bindman (2017) that indeed the proportion of female partners in law and political firms has not increased significantly in many countries, and the salary gap still largely persists, both in the legal profession and elsewhere such as in Europe (UK and the United States) and in Asia (South Korea and Japan). In Indonesia, the gap in position and salary which dominates men and puts women second to none still exists. Yohana (in Bardono 2018) revealed that the number of women in parliament is around 17 percent. While in the DPD it is around 26 percent, almost reaching 30%. In the new government, around 86 women became regional heads from 514 districts/cities.

The fact above makes Enola even though it is present as a counter side to the detective story genre, especially classic detective stories, itself provides inventions that are still related to women's problems in the 21st century. Therefore, this work is very popular despite the formula controversy it does. Below are what readers and viewers have to say about Enola Holmes.

Table 1. Reviewers' Comments

| No | Name | Comments |
|----|-------------------------------|---|
| 1 | Keith Garlington (20-8-22) | It's a fun, vibrant, personality-rich adventure soaked in themes of womanhood, self-discovery, and finding your way in the world. |
| 2 | David Gonzalez (18-02-22) | Enola Holmes was an unexpected but welcome treat. The film offers adventures, comedy, mystery, and personal growth. In a world of cinema where female-led properties are lacking, Enola Holmes is ready to fill that void. |
| 3 | Kay-B (9-2-22) | Enola Holmes is a ride that pays off, giving me a feminist storyline with purpose, a young heroine who saves the day and the men who doubt her, and even glimpses of a budding romance rooted in mutual respect and shared goals. |
| 4 | Nicole Ackman (1-02-21) | Enola Holmes is a very worthy addition to the Sherlock Holmes canon. |
| 5 | Carla Hay (18-01-21) | Enola Holmes vibrantly does justice to the mystery book series for which it is named, thanks to a splendid cast and a twist-filled, engaging adventure |

| No | Name | Comments |
|----|--------------------------------|---|
| | | that will leave viewers wanting more Enola Holmes movies. |
| 6 | Pete Vonder Haar (15-01-21) | Leans hard into the idea that the turn of the century will usher in an era of reform. This is, of course, at odds with reality as well as the fin de siècle thinking of the time. |

The comments above show that readers are especially amused by talking about women and women as the main characters in big genre stories such as detectives. This is in line with the opinion of Maheboob (2018) that besides a large sales-related industry, entertainment or pleasure is the next important logic in defining and understanding the concept of popular fiction. This opinion is supported by the fact that basically, popular works are works created by humans and accepted by society. This causes readers or connoisseurs of popular works to be an important element in seeing the success or popularity of a work.

Furthermore, works of popular fiction are produced with the aim of attracting the attention of the largest number of people and the entertainment component of a work is a source of worldwide appeal. This attracts a large number of readers who are always looking for pleasure because they get something from reading the work. Readers try to escape life's problems and enjoy the world of imagination to find entertainment (Maheboob, 2018, p. 43). Gelder (2004, p. 34) sees the phenomenon of popular fiction from another point of view, namely the function of popular works can be escapism and mere entertainment from life. Therefore, writers—who are also readers—reach the masses through the element of entertainment. When a writer writes a book, he expects the readers to be entertained. Examples of the six comments above show that they accept the formula for finding problems or issues of femininity with its relation to the mysterious world of the detective genre. Not a few, readers and viewers cannot accept Enola because of the big changes and contradictions in the characters and even the formulations offered, but Springer and Thorne are trying to voice and make people aware of 21st century issues which turn out to be extensions of 19th century issues. Therefore, readers see that there is a similarity in reality and the desire to be able to face problems like Enola who developed into a more independent person but still knows her own weaknesses.

Conclusion

Enola Holmes is a spin-off story from the canonical Sherlock Holmes. This story formula shows that Enola Holmes still considers a detective story as it followed the formulated storyline of the classical genre detective. However,

considering the development of the era, it also affected the genre formulation as happened in the rise of the *hardboiled* detective story. Enola Holmes—as the product of the 21st century—also got the effect of the development of the issue in society and one of them is femininity. This issue lies in the element of the story as formula invention yet also becomes controversial as it is ‘destroying’ the line of the detective genre. Enola also shows that the story that takes place is an allusion to the male-centric pattern which is the main foundation of the detective genre which always includes the world of men. Enola also teaches readers and gives readers pleasure because it discusses issues of women's lives that are still dominated by a male environment in the 21st century even though the story is set in the 19th century.

Research on the Enola Holmes formula, especially inventions, can still be seen in terms of adding to the crime formula after being influenced by the hardboiled detective genre. However, this research only briefly discusses the invention of femininity. This research also opens the opportunity to be able to examine the invention of femininity in more detail in Enola Holmes.

References

- Adi, I. R. (2016). *Flksi Populer: Teori & Metode Kajian*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Belajar.
- Angraini, A., & Retnaningdyah, P. (2022). Women's Rebellion to Find Voices in Enola Holmes. *Anaphora: Journal of Language, Literary, and Cultural Studies*, 5(1). Hlm 104-116.
- Barnett, D. (2017, March 23). *Dames, detectives and dope: why we still love hardboiled crime*. The Guardian. <https://www.theguardian.com/books/2017/mar/23/detective-fiction-hardboiled>.
- Bardono, S. (2018, April 27). *LIPI Soroti Peran Perempuan di Abad 21*. Technology-Indonesia. <https://technology-indonesia.com/lain-lain/umum-lain-lain/lipi-soroti-perempuan-di-abad-21/>
- Beauvoir, Simone de. (Trans.). (1956). *The Second Sex*. London: Lowe and Brydone (Printers) LTD.
- Bhattacharya, S. (2020, September 23). *Enola Holmes author Nancy Springer on her popular mystery series and the Netflix adaptation*. Living News. <https://www.firstpost.com/living/enola-holmes-author-nancy-springer-on-her-popular-mystery-series-and-the-netflix-adaptation-8801141.html>.
- Bindmas. (2017, August 16). *Gender Inequality in 21st Century Britain: Using litigation as a tool*. Bindmas. <https://www.bindmans.com/knowledge-hub/blogs/gender-inequality-in-21st-century-britain-using-litigation-as-a-tool/>.
- Cawelti, J. G. (1971). *The Six-Gun Mystique*. Ohio: Bowling Green University Popular Press.
- Cawelti, J. G. (1975). Myths of Violence in American Popular Culture. *Chicago Journals*, 1(3). Hlm 521-541.
- Cawelti, J. G. (1976). *Adventure, Mystery, and Romance: Formula Stories as Art and Popular Culture*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press.
- Claire. (2016, September 20). *A comprehensive time of men telling women what to wear*. Marieclaire. <https://www.marieclaire.co.uk/reports/timeline-of-dress-codes-men-telling-women-what-to-wear-295043>.

- Cronin, B. (2023, January 1). *The Last Sherlock Holmes Story Finally Hits Public Domain*. CBR. <http://www.cbr.com/last-sherlock-holmes-story-finally-hits-public-domain/>
- Crrlstaff. (2018, April 26). *Literary Origins: Sherlock Holmes and the History of Detective Fiction*. Library Point. <https://www.librarypoint.org/blogs/post/history-of-detective-fiction/>.
- Emsley, C., Hitchcock, T., & Shoemaker, R. (2021, February 23). *Historical Background-Gender in the Proceedings*. Old Bailey Proceedings Online. <https://www.oldbaileyonline.org/static/Gender.jsp>.
- Faruk. (2012). *Metode Penelitian Sastra: Sebuah Penjelajahan Awal*. Yogyakarta: Pustaka Pelajar.
- Fuanda, N. (2015). *Reformulating Dracula in the early 21st Century: Genre Analysis of 24 Vampire Films* (Master Thesis). Universitas Gadjah Mada.
- Gelder, K. (2004). *Popular Fiction: The Logics and Practices of a Literary Field*. New York and Canada: Routledge.
- George, M. W. (2008). *The Element of Library Research: What Every Student Needs to Know*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Goodreads. (2020, September 24). *Jack Thorne-Enola Holmes Interview* [Video]. Youtube. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=d_b4fyypU&ab_channel=Goodreads. on 12 February 2023.
- Hill, N. (2020, January 23). *A (Mostly) Definitive Ranking of Sherlock Holmes Adaptations*. Book Riot. <https://bookriot.com/best-sherlock-holmes-adaptations/>.
- Hughes, K. (2014, May 15). *Gender roles in the 19th century*. British Library. <https://www.bl.uk/romantics-and-victorians/articles/gender-roles-in-the-19th-century>.
- IrishAid. (2011, December 20). *Gender Equality, one decade into the 21st century*. Relief Web. <https://reliefweb.int/report/world/gender-equality-one-decade-21st-century>.
- Koliosa, O., V. (2019). Detective Stories: From Classic to Postmodern. Definition and History. *Vector of the Development of Philological Sciences at the Modern Stage*. pp 95-113.
- Lenaini, I. (2021). Teknik Pengambilan Sampel Purposive dan Snowball Sampling. *Jurnal Kajian, Penelitian & Pengembangan Pendidikan Sejarah*, 6(1), 33-39.
- Lyons, P., & Doueck, H. J. (2010). *The Dissertation: From Beginning to End: Pocket Guide to Social Work Research Methods*. USA: Oxford University Press.
- Maheboob, M. T. (2018). Popular Fiction: Some Theoretical Perspectives. *Epitome: International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research*, pp. 37-46.
- Martin, E. (2023). *The Appeal of Sherlock Holmes*. Novel Suspects. <https://www.novelsuspects.com/articles/the-appeal-of-sherlock-holmes/#:~:text=Holmes%20is%20amazingly%20intelligent%20and,to%20movie%20and%20much%20more>.
- Nachbar, J., & Lause, K. (1992). *Popular Culture: An Introductory Text*. USA: Bowling Green University Press.
- Paananen, A. (2021). Representation of Gender Roles in the Novel An Enola Holmes Mystery #1: The Case of the Missing Marquess and its Netflix Film Adaptation. *English Languages and Literature*, pp. 1-30.
- Paechter, C. (2007). *Being Boys, Being Girls: Learning masculinities and femininities*. New York: Open University Press.
- Phipps, C. (2021, November 15). *Why we should still be concerned about gender inequality in the UK*. LSE. <https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/socialbusinesshub/2021/11/15/why-we-should-still-be-concerned-about-gender-inequality-in-the-uk/>.

- Readmikenow. (2022, December 21). *Dr. Joseph Bell: The Man who Inspired Sherlock Holmes*. Owlcation. <https://owlcation.com/humanities/The-Person-Who-Inspired-the-Character-Sherlock-Holmes-Dr-Joseph-Bell#:~:text=The%20well%2Dknown%20character%20of,featuring%20the%20character%20he%20inspired.>
- Reddy, M. T. (2003). *Traces, Codes, and Clues: Reading Race in Crime Fiction*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press.
- Sakinah, H., Setyorini, A., & Masulah. (2022). Characterization of Enola Holmes in The Case of Missing Marquess: A Study of Liberal Feminism. *PHILOLOGY: Journal of English Language and Literature*, 2(1). pp. 20-28.
- Siegel, K. (2001). *Introduction to Modern Literary Criticism: Literary Trends and Influences*. Milwaukee: Barbra Bied Sperling. <https://www.kristisiegel.com/theory.htm>.
- Social and Family Life in the Late 17th & Early 18th Centuries*. (n.d). British Literature Wiki: <https://sites.udel.edu/britlitwiki/social-and-family-life-in-the-late17th-early-18th-centuries/>
- Springer, N. (2006). *An Enola Holmes Mystery: The Case of Missing Marquess*. New York: Penguin Books.
- William, R. (1977). *Marxism and Literature*. New York: Oxford.