WEAK VERSION OF COMMUNICATIVE LANGUAGE TEACHING (CLT) IN SPEAKING AT THE BEGINNER LEVEL

By:
Meutia Pebriani, Muhammad Sukirlan, Flora
FKIP Universitas Lampung, Jl. Prof. Soemantri Brojonegoro No.1
Email: meutia.pebriani@gmail.com; Telp: 085269172000

ABSTRACT

Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) can be an alternative method to teach speaking skills. Since English in Indonesia is a foreign language, the weak version is appropriate to apply in the classroom. Therefore, the objective of this research was to explore the students’ constraints of teaching speaking through CLT and whether there is the significant effect of CLT, particularly in weak version of CLT on the students’ speaking achievement. The result shows that the constraints are not only from five aspects of speaking like vocabulary, grammar, pronunciation, fluency, and comprehension but also come from others like nervousness, anxiety, and feeling embarrassed to make a mistake. The statistical data revealed that the result was significant (p = 0.00<0.005). In the other words, H0 was rejected and H1 was accepted.

Keywords: Communicative Language Teaching, Constraints, Speaking.
INTRODUCTION

English plays an important role as an international language that can build up the communication in many fields like science, technology, health, politics, trade, and many other fields. English is regarded as a foreign language in several countries and it is positioned as second language in some other countries. As a result, if people want to get better chance in finding jobs with good position they should improve their English proficiency whether as passive or active learner. Due to that situation, government tries to follow the market need by improving human resources. Education field is the focus sector that changes everytime. There are four skills that should be mastered to improve English. They are listening, speaking, reading and also writing. Among these skills, speaking is one of the most important skills that become the focus of the study since the students learn English. Ur (1991: 120) states that speaking seems intuitively the most important. People who know a language are referred to as ‘speaker’ of that language, as if speaking included all other kinds of knowing and many if not most foreign language learners are primarily interested in learning to speak.

In addition, Rocio (2012: 19) stated that speaking is generally thought to be the most important of the four skills and to see the basic knowledge of someone’s mastering the language. It is important to pay Communicative Language Teaching (CLT) is a method that has been implemented in recent decades both in ESL or EFL country. It reflects communicative competence as the principle. CLT holds that language attention on the way of teaching speaking. Richard (2009:25) explains that determining what kinds of speaking activities the course will focus on. Different speaking activities such as conversations, group discussions, and speeches make different types of demands on learners. They require different kinds and levels of preparation and support and different criteria obviously have to be used in assessing how well students carry them out.

Speaking, especially in a foreign language, is a very demanding activity for all ages of learners. In order to share understanding with other people using a foreign language, one needs to pay attention to precise details of the language. The students are not only given the opportunity to learn language but also an appropriate activity to learn and produce speaker’s competence to communicate the target language which will improve student’s communication skill. In contrast, Sayuri (2016: 48) stated that or Indonesian, to understand English speaking is difficult because their mother tongue is not English. Sayuri, (2016: 54) also found that the students also faced other problems in speaking, namely; not having self-confidence, being afraid of making mistakes, shyness to others, nervousness, inhabit in speaking English, never practice and nothing to say.

English should be learned through use and through communication. If we return back to the history of communicative language teaching we find that it started developing in Great Britain in 1960s as an
alternative method to the earlier structural methods when applied linguistics began to question the assumption in delaying the situational language teaching. Howatt (1984:12) as cited in Karakas (2013:4) distinguished weak and strong version of CLT. Weak version stresses the importance of providing learners with opportunities to use their English with communicative purposes and attempts to integrate such activities into a wider program of language teaching. For instance, footprints of structuralism appear still available in the weak version like combination of linguistic study, and controlled practice and wide use of PPP (present-practice-produce) principle. Meanwhile, strong version of CLT claims that language is acquired through communication. The concept of CLT explains that when the learners study about a language and the learners also can acquire the language and systematically learn about the language, know what to say, with whom, when and also where.

**Principles of Weak Version**

Ellis, et. al (2013: 45) gave the principles or theoretical assumption of weak version of CLT as follows:

1. Instructional needs to ensure that learners develop both a rich repertoire of formulaic expressions and rule-based competence.
2. Instruction needs to ensure that learners focus on meaning.
3. Instruction needs to ensure that learners focus on form.
4. Instruction needs to be predominantly directed at developing implicit knowledge of the L2 while not neglecting explicit knowledge.
5. Instruction needs to take account of the order and sequence of acquisition.
6. Successful instructed language learning requires extensive L2 input.
7. The opportunity to interact in the L2 is central to developing L2 Proficiency.
8. Instruction needs to take account for individual differences in learners.
9. Instruction needs to take account of the fact that there is a subjective aspect to language learning.
10. In assessing learner’s proficiency, it is important to examine free as well as controlled production.

By using weak version, the students can use the language contextually. In other words, the grammar is not taught systematically but it can be mixed between meaningful content and grammar content especially through speaking. Even though learners could master to create correct sentences, they could still not be proficient to use the language for meaningful communication. It is for that reason that the core of language teaching according to CLT is focused on the communicative competence and the term takes into consideration the following aspects of language knowledge: Knowing how to use for a range of different purposes and functions, knowing how to vary our use of language according to the setting and the participants, knowing how to produce and understand different types of texts, knowing how to maintain communication despite having limitation in one’s language knowledge (Richard, 2006: 3).
In the other hands, (Anderson, 1993; Ellis, 1996; Li, 1998; Liao, 2000; Takanashi, 2004; Yu, 2001) was quoted in Chang (2010:3) stated that the theories and practices of CLT have faced various challenges in EFL contexts. In addition, Various research studies reported that instruction in EFL classrooms was still based on the traditional approach (Littlewood, 2007; Nunan, 2003; Savignon and Wang, 2003) quoted in Chang (2010:5). Chinese teachers also expressed difficulties in including cultural aspects into their classes because of lack of experience in an English speaking country (Liao, 2003; Yu, 2001) quoted in Chang (2010:5).

From the explanation above it is clear that there are pro and contra about applying CLT in EFL context. CLT has advantage and disadvantage in its implementation. The implementation of weak version of CLT which there is still grammar teaching implicitly. Therefore, the aims of this research are: 1) to know the student’s constraints before speaking learning through CLT. 2) To know whether there is a significant improvement in students’ speaking through Communicative Language Teaching.

### RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The population of this research was the first semester students of IBI Darmajaya in academic year 2017/2018. The researcher only took one class that was given the treatements. The subject was 35 students from informatic system. To know the students' constraints before the implementation weak version of CLT, the researcher did the interview. On the other side, to investigate the increasing of students’ speaking achievement, the researcher used speaking test. Inter rater helped the researcher to examine students’ speaking ability in the form of speaking test.

### RESULT AND DISCUSSION

#### The students' Constraints.

This section answers the first research question, that is, to investigate students' constraint before speaking learning through CLT. The data collecting techniques were also taken from the interview at the beginning of the treatment about the students’ constraints in learning English. The appendix provides an overview to see the detail transcription. In transcribing the data, the researcher creates the table of specification to see whether the students had constraints in language aspects or other aspects. The result of the table can be drawn into the table.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Items</th>
<th>Amount</th>
<th>%</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Anxiety</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Shyness/ unconfidence to make mistake</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Language Aspects</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Lack of vocabulary</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>Lack of grammar</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Lack of Pronunciation</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Lack of Comprehension</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The result of constraints in language aspects, lack of vocabulary (68%) became the most challenging constraint for the students. The students also described that they got the difficulty in pronunciation (20%), grammar (5%) and comprehension (5%). Lack of language aspect effect another aspect for example Anxiety (15%) and embarrassed to make a mistake or unconfident (17%).

The Student’s Speaking Improvement.
In order to see whether the objective of the research could be achieved or not, the researcher presented the analysis of pretest and posttest. Generally, there was an improvement between pre-test and post-test by using CLT in the class. There was also a significant difference in every aspect of speaking such as fluency, vocabulary, comprehension, grammar, and pronunciation. Based on the score, CLT gave a positive effect in all aspect but the biggest improvement of the score can be seen in fluency and comprehensibility.

Table 2. The Increasing of Students Speaking Achievement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pair 1</th>
<th>Pretest</th>
<th>Posttest</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>63.07</td>
<td>73.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Std Error Mean</td>
<td>1.392</td>
<td>1.530</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Based on the table above, it could be seen that the increase about 9.86 point after giving the treatment. The highest score of pre-test was 80 and the highest score of posttest was 96. The gain score was 16. The lowest score of pretest was 48 and the lowest score of post-test was 68. The gain score was 20. In testing hypothesis, the researcher used statistical computerization i.e repeated measure T-test of SPSS 16. 00 for windows to analyze the increase of students gain, whether it significant or not, in which the significance was determined by P < 0.05. The T-Test revealed that the result was significant (p = 0.00). Thus, there is an increase of students' speaking improvement before and after being taught by using communicative language teaching. In other words, Ho was rejected and H1 was accepted.
DISCUSSION
Discussion of Constraints

The constraints or the problem of the students were analyzed based on the interview before teaching-learning process. The researcher transcribed the result of the interview related to their constraints in English. The researcher particularly elaborated the constraints of language aspects into grammar, vocabulary, pronunciation and other aspects (nervousness, anxiety, and unconfidence). The result has supported Sayuri research (2016:3) that the students are still confused to make conversation, deliver statements, and give opinions by using English whether in the classroom or out of the classroom. They are lack of vocabulary, pronunciation, grammar usage, and also mental of the students which caused a lack of self-confidence.

Vocabulary
Vocabulary plays an essential role in expressing ideas and thoughts. In this present study, the results of speaking test and interview showed that vocabulary and lack of vocabulary become the constraints for students to engage in speaking. In this research, the research had already selected the authentic material by giving three topics: description, opinion, and past experience. In applying the three topics, the researcher used the personal identity of student’s friend, daily cases around of the students, and calendar to create information gap and contextual meaning.

By giving the real-life condition, it helps students to share his/her ideas. In the interview, the students said that this was the first time they did the activity in the class. They did not have enough material to learn outside the class. Ahmed (2015: 123-124) explained that the lack of authentic communicative materials and the poor environment inside and outside the classrooms, the shortage of references and periodicals, the lack of interaction with native speakers of English, and the kind of students themselves they do not favor guessing, using synonyms or paraphrasing, when they are not sure about the correct meaning of particular word, the poor performance of student, a lack of knowledge of the fundamentals of the language.

This statement supports the constraint of the students when they are not sure about the correct meaning of the particular word, the poor performance of the student, a lack of knowledge of the fundamentals of the language. Apart from it, the modified target language input which is gotten from conversational interactions between the teacher and learners enables them to get a better understanding of vocabulary knowledge. It also happens in this research, but the researcher found some mistakes in vocabulary. For example:

- She has low body and fat.
- He is always smile and everyone will like he sens the first time.
- I disagree because assisenment make me too easy super growth.

Two utterances above mean the students can deliver and mention the
word well but incorrectly written as the original word.

**Pronunciation**

English pronunciation instruction is difficult for some reasons. Gilakjani (2016: 1) asserts that the goal of pronunciation is not to ask learners to pronounce like native speakers. Instead, the intelligible pronunciation should be the real purpose of oral communication. It means that applying CLT for teaching pronunciation was a good implementation. In this present study, the result of the speaking test showed that 20% of students got difficulty in pronunciation. Gilakjani (2016: 3) also explained that many teachers are not aware of the importance of pronunciation. Teachers pay enough attention to grammar and vocabulary in learning a foreign language. It is proved by the present study, the researcher found a mistake from the student.

- *And Saturday lost I meet with my friend in pizza hut.*

The utterance above showed that the student incorrectly pronounced the word last. It also affects the vocabulary aspect because the word lost have different meaning with last. In that utterance also made an ungrammatical sentence. It should be “I meet with my friend at Pizza Hut last Saturday”. In short, the effect of pronunciation to the vocabulary and grammar seems important.

**Other Aspects (Shyness, Anxiety, and Unconfidence)**

Speaking English for most Indonesia students is very challenging in terms of bravery to speak the language to their English teachers and to the English native speakers. Most of the students will be very proud when they are able to speak the language fluently. But they found some constraints also in terms of other aspects besides language aspects. The researcher found the aspects shyness, anxiety, and unconfidence based on the interview with the students. It is supported by Juhana (2012: 108) concludes that students have psychological factors such as fear of mistake, shyness, anxiety, and the like that hinder them from practicing their speaking in English class.

- *Because him is my close friend if I am have a job or apa tugas apa?*
- *Oh, task.. task apa? He is apa? He is help me to work it.*

To make it clear the researcher elaborated it one by one. It can be described as follows:

1. **Shyness**

Jannah et. al (2016: 69) defined that shyness is identified as an emotional thing that many students suffer from at some time when they are required to speak English.” Other researcher said Al-Nakhalah (2016: 102) that shyness plays an important role in speaking performance done by the students. This fact is also found in the data of this study that students’ shyness is their perception of their own ability. The teacher should encourage them to speak.

*Question:* Why do you feel embarrassed?

*Student 6:* I feel shy because I do not understand.

*Question:* When you make a mistake what will you do? Do you feel embarrassed or nervous?

*Student 8:* Yes miss I feel nervous and embarrassed

*Question:* When I asked you to speak in front of the class. Do you have a problem?

*Student 1:* I feel embarrassed. Hmmm I little bit confused about the words in english.
From the explanation, it was clear that when the students made a mistake they feel so shy to perform speaking in front of the class. Because they felt shy they have lack motivation in learning English. It influenced their performance in learning speaking.

2. Anxiety
Anxiety is a feeling of tension and apprehension and nervousness associated with the situation of learning a foreign language (Jannah, 2016: 70). Their low ability in this aspect, in many cases causes anxious feeling among many students. Mukminin, et al (2015: 37) concluded that the causes of student’s anxiety to speaking inside and outside the classroom are low speaking skill, fear of negative responses from others, low self-esteem to speak English, ear of failure to speak English with teachers, and cultural influences to speak English due to more teacher-centered. In line with this present study, the factor of low speaking skill is related to the problem with lack of vocabularies, of grammar, and bad pronunciation, which finally made them anxious to speak English. It is really supported the constraints which occurred in weak version of CLT for Beginner at the IBI Darmajaya.

Student 5: I made a mistake in explaining the age, weight and height.
Question: After I asked you to explain your own idea. You should present your material to your partner. Do you find difficulties?
Student 5: Yes, I do.
Question: What is that?
Student 5: I do not know how to pronounce it correctly and I do not feel confidence. I feel anxiety to speak with the others.

From the explanation, it was clear that because they have bad pronunciation they felt the anxiety to speak to the others. It was clear that the aspect of speaking gives an effect on the students. The researcher selected the students who should be interviewed is the low-level students in the classroom. The other researchers, Kara, et.al (2017: 73) also concluded that though personal reasons are not perceived as significant for the failure in speaking by learners, they need to be studied in terms of motivation, anxiety, and barriers for speaking in another language. This explanation suggests that teacher should make an attempt to create a learning atmosphere which gives students more comfortable situation in their learning activity (Al-Nakhalah, 2016: 102).

3. Unconfidence
Unconfidence or lack of self-confidence can be thought under both titles of psychological and attitudinal barriers that makes learner hard to speak in a foreign language and even in mother tongue (Guhler, 2015: 15). It is commonly understood that students’ lack of confidence usually occurs when students realize that their conversation partners do not understand them or when they do not understand other speakers (Jannah, 2016: 70). According to Guhler (2015: 14) also found among all other language skills, speaking is an exclusive place to have effective communication, and self-confidence is one of the facilitators to start the conversation.
Here are the examples of the interview:

**Question:** When I asked you to speak in front of the class. What do you feel?
**Student 4:** I feel afraid they do not listen to me.
**Student 5:** I feel nervous and embarrassed to make a mistake.

Based on the interview, the students got the difficulties in catching the idea because of the limitation of vocabulary even they felt difficult to express the idea because they have the limitation in the component of speaking including pronunciation, grammar, vocabulary, fluency, and comprehension. Limitation of those speaking component effect another factor like self-confidence to make a mistake. Therefore, the teacher should create a comfortable atmosphere in which learners are encouraged to talk in English and are praised in talking (Al-Nakhalah, 2016: 103).

Koosa and Yakabi (2013: 3-4) explained that CLT was more successful in English as a second language (ESL) context because students have the motivation to work oral English because they need it in their lives. They also elaborated the physical limitations in EFL context such as the purpose of learning English, learning environment, teachers’ English proficiency, and the availability of the authentic English materials, CLT meets much more difficulties during its application.

**Discussion in Speaking Improvement.**

**CLT and Comprehensibility**

In this research, comprehensibility became the first rank which gave a good effect to the students by applying the CLT. Since, the sample of the research was university students, it affected their comprehension in speaking. EFL class in Indonesia force students to focus on form and meaning. The fact, students will engage to speak when they understand the meaning of the content what they want to deliver. It also supported Young Jung’s definition (2010: 145) about comprehensibility is focusing on meaning. During the treatment, the students were given some activities related to the principle of weak version. To improve the student's comprehensibility in the treatment, the researcher asked the students to fullfilled the form. For example in the second treatment the students were asked to give an opinion about the topic and also the reason.

In this stage the student practiced their comprehensibility, then they should explain their opinion to their partner. There was a question and answer session between the students. So here, the students practice their comprehensibility, vocabulary, fluency, and pronunciation. This activity based on the principle of weak version which is instructional needs to ensure that the learners develop both a rich repertoire of formulaic expression and rule-based competence. The students did not only learn about expression how to describe someone or something but also they learned how to produce present tense sentence.
CLT and Vocabulary

Vocabulary item in this present study got the third rank. It also represented why grammar and vocabulary became the social phenomenon for Indonesian learner in speaking. Wilkin (1972:97) as cited in Lessard-Clouston (1994: 69) states that there is not much value in being able to produce grammatical sentences if one has not got the vocabulary that is needed to convey what one wishes to say, while without grammar very little can be conveyed, without vocabulary nothing can be conveyed. This clarified that vocabulary and grammar were equipped with others. The more someone understands the vocabulary in a sentence, the better he/she will be. In every treatment the students were asked to fulfill the form related to the topic. Three different topics were implemented during the treatment. The activity was given related to the principle and also the stages of weak version of CLT. For example in the first treatment, the students were asked to describe their best friend based on the question given.

In this stage the student practiced their comprehensibility, then they should explain their opinion to their partner. There was a question and answer session between the students. So here, the students practiced their comprehensibility, vocabulary, fluency, and pronunciation. This activity based on the principle of weak version which is instructional needs to ensure that the learners develop both a rich repertoire of formulaic expression and rule-based competence, meaning and also form. The students did not only learn about expression how to describe someone or something but also they learned how to produce present tense sentence.

CLT and Fluency

Based on the result, there is an improvement in fluency of the students. It took the third rank after comprehensibility. Based on the observation sheet, students will have a good fluency when they mingle in a pair or group. They feel comfortable in speaking. Dealing with Frianti et al (2017: 35) stated that the treatment with the communicative approach (CLT) forced the students to think quickly and said their opinion right away. It made the students accustomed to speaking which also trained their speaking fluency. It indicated why students were good at speaking especially fluency item. By applying CLT (giving the picture, students’ group work, role play). During the treatment to improve their fluency the students were asked to explain or describe what they have fulfilled in based on the topic. They should present the material with their partner, group, and in front of the class. In this activity the learners developed both a rich repertoire of formulaic expression and rule-based competence, meaning and also form.

CLT and Grammar

To develop the students’ grammar the researcher gave the students activity based on the principle. In the treatment the students were asked to fulfill the agenda based on their activity last week. Here the students were given the example first, then they should explain them. For example:

Last week I met my friend in MBK.
On Wednesday I studied English

This activity was based on the principle of weak version, it was focused on form and meaning and the students develop their implicit knowledge about the form. Here the students were hoped not only to know about the form but also how to use it in a meaningful context.

CLT and Pronunciation

This chapter first explains the challenges of CLT in English pronunciation teaching on a general level and then from the viewpoint of EFL lecturer especially in IBI Darmajaya Bandar Lampung. Levis et al (2017: 14) concluded CLT has not actually decreased the importance given to pronunciation in the long run, but it affected how we conceive of pronunciation teaching.

In CLT, the learning of language items was difficult because the use of language in communicative activities should be communicatively as authentic as possible instead of highlighting the language items, which is the goal in language drills and exercises. To develop the student's pronunciation the students were asked to present what they have fulfilled to their partner, group and in front of the class. So, here they did not only practice their form but also they fluency and pronunciation. It was in line with the principle of weak version which is focused on form and meaning.

CONCLUSION

CLT is proved as an effective approach in many countries all over the world because it can help learners to communicate competently in the real life situation. Although CLT is regarded as an outstanding approach, the level success of applying this approach is varied in different contexts. It is important for the teacher to plan the lessons carefully based on the students level before applying them in the class. Because the implementation of CLT is beginner level students, there are the speaking constraints found in this research: vocabulary, and pronunciation (as the highest rank of speaking test results). Other constraints which become the factors are feeling of nervousness, anxiety and lack of confidence. The constraints in speaking achievement through CLT can be minimized if the teacher uses the CLT principles well in the classroom. The teacher should consider a suitable activity for the student based on their ability in English. Because it is speaking class it is suggested to conduct weak version of CLT in a small class. So the teacher can monitor the students’ activity in the class.

REFERENCES


Al Nahkhalah, A.M.M. 2016. Problems and difficulties of


